

# Education International



## Report of the Second International Conference on Higher Education and Research

Budapest, 23 to 25 September 1999

*Education International  
Bd du Roi Albert II, 5  
1210 Brussels - Belgium  
Tel: 32 2 224 06 11  
Fax: 32 2 224 06 06  
Email: [headoffice@ei-ie.org](mailto:headoffice@ei-ie.org)  
Internet: <http://www.ei-ie.org>*

El has a membership of 296 national unions representing some 24 million teachers and workers in education, from pre-school to university.

Reproduction is permitted without authorization. Please cite the source and send us a copy.

Conférence internationale sur l'enseignement supérieur et la recherche

Conferencia Internacional sobre la Enseñanza Superior y la Investigación

## Table of Contents

Introduction .....	5
Opening addresses.....	6
Higher education 2000.....	6
Partnership 2000 .....	6
Impact of economic transition on higher education .....	8
Challenges for developing countries and countries in transition .....	10
Challenges in developing countries.....	10
Malaysia .....	12
Problems of higher education in countries in transition .....	13
Steps to overcome the challenges to higher education .....	14
Trade union action.....	14
Transnational higher education and faculty unions .....	15
Distance education and socialisation .....	15
Accreditation.....	15
Undermining traditional institutions.....	16
Export markets – reality in developing countries .....	16
Intellectual property .....	17
Trade union action.....	18
University governance, academic freedom, autonomy and social change .....	20
Academic freedom and/or autonomy?.....	20
Influence of international organisations .....	21
Trade union action.....	22
Salary determination and collective bargaining.....	23
Centralised and decentralised bargaining .....	23
Trade union action.....	24
Diversity, discrimination and career development paths.....	25
Discrimination in academic profession .....	25
Exclusion .....	26
Unions and discrimination .....	27
Trade union action.....	28
Research and research funding.....	29
Public and private funding sources.....	29
Working conditions .....	29
Trade union action.....	30
Higher education and research unions and the broader trade union movement .....	31
Trade union action.....	31
Higher education and research union strategies in EI .....	33
Trade union action.....	33
Conclusion .....	36
Conference Programme.....	38

Participants' List.....	40
Annex 1 Speech by Fred van LEEUWEN, General Secretary of Education International .....	42
Annex 2 Recommendation concerning the WTO Millennium Round .....	46
Annex 3 Recommendation concerning the implementation of Article 75 of the Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel.....	48
Annex 4 Recommendation concerning the commercialisation of higher education and public sector research .....	49
Annex 5 Recommendation on East Timor .....	50
Annex 6 Recommendation on the situation in Ethiopia.....	52

## Introduction

Since Education International's (EI) foundation in 1993, there has been dramatic growth in its higher education and research union membership. This is marked by a more comprehensive coverage of the sector by EI globally. At the time of this report, EI represented around 840,000 members in 24 higher education or research-specific unions and 54 general teachers' unions.

This development has both built and been helped by EI's growing influence with the international and inter-governmental bodies with which it co-operates and communicates. This is demonstrated, for example, by the close involvement of UNESCO in both EI's International Conferences on Higher Education and Research.

The Second EI International Conference on Higher Education and Research in Budapest brought together 80 representatives of EI affiliates in the sector from around the world. One of its fundamental aims was to strengthen EI's position as the representative global organisation of teachers and research workers. It was also designed to develop the role of these higher education and research unions.

The authority with which EI can speak as the voice of higher education teachers and research workers depends on the capacity for participation of its representative affiliates and the level of exchanges between affiliates and EI at the national, regional and global levels. The Conference played an important part in both providing a forum for exchanges on substantive issues and for examining ways in which dialogue between higher education and research unions and EI takes place. It also looked at how to develop this dialogue within EI.

The 1990s have seen a rapid increase in the pace of development of trends such as globalisation, deregulation and decentralisation, accompanied by the threatened casualisation and de-professionalisation of academic labour in many countries. The exponential development of new technology and its applications in higher education and research have formed a backdrop to these trends.

Workshop discussions during the Conference explored key themes with these underlying trends never far from the surface. Indeed, these issues were raised time and again in a wide range of contexts. Discussions offered both suggestions for policy and for concrete strategies for EI and its constituent organisations to defend this key sector and to be proactive in shaping these millennial trends to meet the needs of higher education and research workers and the societies they serve.

With the approach of the new millennium, more and deeper change is about to be launched. The growing integration of education in world trade is a matter of concern for education unions globally and this issue was raised on numerous occasions throughout the conference. The challenges before the higher education and research sector, its workers and their representative organisations are considerable. Nevertheless, Conference delegates laid the foundations for comprehensive strategy and appropriate trade union action to tackle these developments, protect the interests of their members and help guide the development of the higher education and research sector to best respond to the needs of a changing society.

## Opening addresses

Participants to this key event were welcomed to Budapest by representatives of the host unions: Gabor Borbath of the Hungarian Teachers' Association (SEH) and Gabor Szabo of the Higher Education Teachers' Union (FDSZ). They emphasised the importance of the agenda items in terms of the future overall environment of the higher education sector and called for the full participation of all delegates. The sharing of information between EI affiliates at such events is crucial to trade unions in developing appropriate responses to the challenges confronting the sector at the turn of the millennium.

### Higher education 2000

In his address, **EI General Secretary Fred van Leeuwen**<sup>1</sup> emphasised that the organisation needs to be "active, present, visible and recognised as a determining force in this sector at the international level." Having played a significant role in the lead up to the adoption of the UNESCO Recommendation Concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel, EI is now actively monitoring its implementation, particularly in the area of academic freedom.

He noted that "higher education has a crucial role to play in the scientific, technological, economic, social and cultural development of every country... it also has an irreplaceable role to play in the evolution of education systems and the training of teachers." In addition, higher education is crucial in the promotion of human rights, democracy and cultural and intellectual tolerance.

Picking up on the themes underpinning the conference discussions, van Leeuwen underscored their importance in the development of higher education and research, in particular:

- free access to higher education for those meeting relevant entry criteria;
- priority of public funding for universities, colleges and research institutions;
- institutional autonomy and academic freedom for the above institutions; and,
- representation of staff on all key decision-making bodies within these institutions.

In concluding, he referred to the need for conference delegates to analyse the challenges confronting higher education today and, on the basis of this analysis, to develop recommendations to shape appropriate EI policies. A particularly important aspect of conference deliberations would be the support and solidarity towards higher education and research personnel and their organisations in developing countries.

### Partnership 2000

"Our two organisations are inextricably linked by a number of fruitful partnership projects." In his opening remarks to the conference, **Mr Komlavi F. Seddoh, Director of UNESCO's Higher Education Division**, emphasised the strong alliance between EI and UNESCO, particularly in working to ensure that teachers world-wide benefit from improved working conditions.

---

<sup>1</sup> The full text of Fred van Leeuwen's speech can be found in Annex 1, p. 33.

Co-operation had been especially productive during UNESCO's World Conference on Higher Education in October 1998 and the development of the Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel which was approved by UNESCO's General Conference in November 1997. This combined effort was particularly important given the significant impact of globalisation on the higher education sector and the challenges to teaching staff and their trade unions.

Globalisation and the development of Information and Communications Technology (ICT) have led to an increased polarisation of societies and a widening of the gap between rich and poor countries and communities. Education has a key role to play in lessening polarisation and closing the North-South divide.

The world is evolving rapidly and education reforms need to be redefined and implemented. Reforms should focus on young people, women and other deprived members of society. Integrated education and training is essential to provide people with the necessary skills to become valued members of society. Education must be made appropriate for a wide range of environments, for example, distance-learning, and should also be kept up-to-date.

Mr Seddoh emphasised the need for higher education to accommodate the future expectations of society through greater research. This will require increased resources, both public and private, being directed to this key sector in education development. However, even though more diverse forms of funding are unavoidable, ethical criteria should underpin the choice of new partners.

It is not possible to conceive new research and higher education policies without taking into account the advantages brought through the development of global, regional and national networks. In promoting new networks, it is essential not to lose sight of the need for increased solidarity, particularly in favour of developing countries.

Another serious challenge for higher education is its capacity to interact with the world of work. The key in this respect is to establish partnerships and not for higher education to submit to the dictates of market forces. Therefore it should fulfil two essential functions: a proactive role closely linked to economic development, and the training and retraining of staff to keep abreast of new developments. In this respect, the participation of teaching staff and students is crucial to the education reform process.

More attention and resources should be directed to continuous in-service training for teaching staff and greater respect should be given to their academic autonomy and freedom. The foregoing comprise the main results of the World Conference on Higher Education. The next stage will be to monitor the implementation of the conference resolution which, in itself, will require a significant amount of resources and enhanced co-operation between UNESCO and its partners, particularly EI and its affiliates. The monitoring process will take place at the national, regional and global level - starting from the grassroots and working upwards.

The participation of trade union organisations will be particularly important during the national activities during which every effort should be made to translate the conference resolution and documents into law and to ensure that adequate resources are allocated from national budgets. Activities at the global level will necessitate close co-operation between Member States to facilitate exchanges of information and experiences in the higher education sector. Developing nations, in particular, will require assistance in elaborating and implementing education reforms. Mr Seddoh emphasised the need for countries to share details of their failures with others, as well as their successes.

Trade unions in the higher education sector should be mobilised in the implementation and monitoring of the conference resolution and documents. The underlying theme is co-operation between all concerned partners, including the World Bank and the World Trade Organisation (WTO). With its regional offices, UNESCO is in the process of putting together regional committees which will monitor and analyse progress and develop action plans and programmes. Co-ordination of effort is necessary to improve and modernise higher education around the world.

In striving to improve the working conditions of higher education staff and the higher education environment itself, UNESCO is reassured by the presence, goodwill and support of El.

### Impact of economic transition on higher education

“The social changes resulting from political reform in Hungary over the last decade have had a significant impact on the higher education sector,” explained Mr Adam Kiss, Hungarian Vice Secretary of State. Up until the early 1990s, universities in Hungary were primarily concerned with research. Since then, their role has changed dramatically. Society today demands a greater number of highly qualified workers and therefore institutions have to offer education to a much wider audience. Lifelong learning is essential for people to keep up to date with socio-economic changes.

Mr Kiss emphasised that the sector has to accommodate changes in the following areas:

- social sciences;
- ICT-related areas - new sources of less expensive technology are opening new avenues in higher education;
- material sciences, such as physics, which have an impact in medical and other fields;
- life sciences, such as genetic engineering, which have consequences for society as a whole.

In spite of the massive changes taking place, Mr Kiss underlined that it was premature to refer to the “demise” of the traditional university - the socialisation process requires them. However, there will inevitably be a quality change in higher education for both students and teaching staff. In addition, institutions will need to become more flexible in future to keep abreast of socio-economic developments. Higher education will need to serve society in two specific areas: to help control unemployment, and, to produce a marketable work-force. Today, students are becoming more interested in being able to work



in other countries. However, resistance among EU Member States remains, particularly in the area of acceptance of different national diplomas.

One of the problems facing Hungary is that institutions proliferated during the Soviet regime. There are now too many and, coupled with the slump in the nation's economy, changes are necessary. Hungarian institutions were also taken aback by the different forms of financing available in a democracy. The key problem facing Hungarian institutions is that there are numerous demands and many students, but very little financing available. This has also had repercussions for the quality of education being provided.

The current government is proposing three responses to deal with the issues confronting higher education:

- establishing larger institutions with more faculties;
- maintaining research levels in universities;
- establishing large institutions in regions other than Budapest.

The next aspect to be considered for change is funding. Under the "head quota" funding system, a number of institutions went bankrupt, while those capable of attracting students prospered. Mr Kiss emphasised the need to finance training, exploiting institutional capacity for research and development in partnership with industry and individual companies. Establishing partnerships between the private sector and institutions will help in easing the financial burden of funding, but will require good administrative structures being in place. He also noted the importance of identifying and funding talent among students.

The government could demand contributions from students themselves for higher education. However, at present 38 per cent of the Hungarian population live below the poverty line and these people would therefore be excluded from tertiary education if such a system was introduced at this point. A comprehensive taxation system has yet to be put in place and it is estimated that it will take around ten years to establish a working system. In addition, banks will not provide credit facilities for students, therefore any new system of funding must take social justice into account.

In closing, Mr Kiss pointed out that the Hungarian government would like its students to participate and learn in institutions in other European countries. Similarly, it would like to invite foreign students to come and study in Hungarian institutions. In this respect, there should be greater freedom for students to move between European countries and a credit system should be developed between participating European institutions.

## Challenges for developing countries and countries in transition

Higher education throws up a great number of challenges to all countries in today's global economy. However, these challenges are particularly significant for developing countries and countries in economic transition. Taking advantage of the conference being held in a country in transition and the presence of a number of delegates from these and developing countries, the conference was able to consider the enormity of these challenges through the presentation of firsthand experiences.

Under the chairmanship of Dr Hamdi Ibrahim of the GTUESR, Egypt, the first part of the session considered the situation in a country in transition, Hungary, and developing countries in general. Presentations were given by Gabor Szabo, FDSZ, and Komlavi Seddoh. In the second part of the session, a round table discussion was organised under the chairmanship of Janez Stergar, ESWUS, Slovenia. Participants in this round table included Gabor Szabo, Komlavi Seddoh, Hamdi Ibrahim, Uo Lim Cheng of the NUTP in Malaysia and Mulatu Mekonnen of the ETA in Ethiopia.

### Challenges in developing countries

There are certain characteristics pertaining particularly to the situation in Africa which could, to a significant degree, be extended to most developing countries.

Political instability. Between 15 to 20 conflicts of a variety of origins currently affect several African regions. Political instability has significantly undermined the development of all levels of the education sector in Ethiopia. There is little or no respect for fundamental human and union rights and the ETA and its members have suffered greatly as a result (see Annex 6, Recommendation on the situation in Ethiopia). Teachers at all levels have been intimidated, harassed, injured, sacked, transferred, kidnapped and murdered. The union itself has had its offices ransacked, closed down, transferred to a surrogate organisation, and its assets frozen. It has become impossible to collect dues from the membership making the most basic of union activities all but impossible.

There has been significant staff turnover in the Ethiopian higher education sector, sometimes through dismissal but also due to the increasing fear for personal safety among staff. The ETA is also concerned about the possible misappropriation of development aid by the authorities that should have been earmarked for use in the education sector.

Pronounced demographic growth. Although annual population growth has slowed in most developing regions, it is still quite pronounced. In Africa, there has been a slight increase since the mid-1970s. However, it is expected that there will be a further period of accelerated growth between 1995 to 2000. For human development policies in the Third World, demographic growth remains a significant challenge.

Illiteracy and poor living conditions. Illiteracy rates remain quite high in many developing countries. This situation is compounded by poor health facilities, high mortality rates, high levels of poverty and a bleak outlook for the future. Statistics in poverty-related areas give rise to increasing concern: AIDS, malnutrition, access to education, unemployment and under-employment.

Other characteristics of challenges facing developing countries include:

- the debt burden;
- the practical application of existing legislation;
- the slow integration of the new technology and communications revolution in the infrastructure of developing countries.

The international community has to face up these challenges for world socio-economic development.

The higher education sector is faced with a series of difficult questions in looking at how to improve conditions for sustained development:

- How to guarantee quality education in the light of decreasing national budgets, increasing numbers of students and the impact of structural adjustment programmes, for example, in reducing the possibility of hiring new teachers? The lack of funding also affects libraries, the maintenance of science equipment and the introduction of new technologies. In addition, few universities have adequate pedagogical resources to train new teachers and provide in-service training for older, qualified teachers. Further efforts should be made to decentralise higher education institutions and establish specialised institutions. Each university in a particular region need not attempt to offer a full range of courses, but rather share resources with others and specialise in particular subjects.
- How to guarantee quality research under the same conditions of decreasing budgets and adequate equipment? Even the most qualified of researchers cannot operate effectively. Sometimes, results of key research activities are not even published owing to the lack of scientific journals in developing countries.
- How to improve the efficiency of higher education?
- How to reconcile the contribution of higher education to the promotion of fundamental democratic values with the risk of excessive political interference? All too often, universities become privileged battlefields for political parties in developing countries - a situation which fuels the position of adversaries to academic freedom and university autonomy.
- How to entrench academic competence in developing countries and their higher education institutions? In most cases, higher education teachers do not benefit from adequate living and working conditions or wage levels. Most are obliged to find a second job to supplement their income and make ends meet. There is an exodus of good, qualified higher education teachers from developing countries, a number of whom find work in other countries with more attractive working conditions.

In considering how to begin to deal with these challenges, the first step must be to create and maintain peace. Resources must be used for development not war. Secondly, higher education institutions must become real tools for development. They should not simply copy systems and procedures used in other countries, but should use the results of research of their own problems and needs. This point was reinforced by Mr Ibrahim who emphasised the need to review and reform existing higher education courses to take into account the needs of society in developing countries. The concept of life-long learning needs to be introduced into higher education and there should be increased emphasis on ICT education.

Higher education institutions need proficient teachers and researchers, competent administrators, properly trained, innovative and with adequate pedagogical resources at their disposal to assist them in their tasks. The area of institutional administration has become more significant as it is required to cope with new plans, structures and strategies. There should also be training for teachers and researchers to use new information and communications technology. Universities should join development networks which would enable their teachers to benefit from exchange programmes. In addition, students need to be admitted and directed in their studies according to their desires and aptitudes.

Mr Seddoh emphasised that education should become more flexible and work in synergy, not only with the state but also with the private sector which should participate more in the development of new forms of education. More efforts should be made to work together towards the creation of jobs. If these reforms are undertaken, then higher education institutions will enhance their image in the eyes of society and the state and thereby improve their relations in general. Improved levels of education at all levels is key to dealing with such challenges as the spread of AIDS in developing countries and dealing with the debt problem - economies must be better managed.

It is essential that developing countries are able to rely more on higher education institutions as dependable partners in consolidating democracy. Once higher education becomes an active partner in society it will rediscover its credibility and the confidence of its students, its teachers and society as a whole. Creative and original solutions are required to improve the situation of higher education in developing countries. Populations need to be trained to help improve difficult economic situations and appropriate strategies must be set in motion in each country concerned.

## Malaysia

Malaysia was presented as a case study on the impact of heavy foreign investment in national education. Higher education is seen by many students in the region as a gateway to improved socio-economic status. Prior to 1990, the scope for young people to continue on with third level education was relatively limited due to the lack of institutions. However, after 1990, the government opened up the country to those foreign institutions willing to establish campuses in Malaysia. Today, around 70 per cent of those completing secondary education can now go on to third level.

This "open door" policy was launched primarily to bring a stop to the "brain drain" that was affecting the country. Malaysia has invested heavily in the ICT industry and needed skilled young people to support this investment. Therefore, considerable investment has also been put into the higher education sector. A body has been established to financially assist those students who could not otherwise afford to go on to third level education. In addition, distance learning technology and techniques are being developed to assist those students who require it.

Mr Cheng noted that a significant number of foreign institutions have now established a presence in Malaysia and "roadshows" are becoming a common occurrence as competition sets in to attract new students. Foreign universities now accommodate one-third of all Malaysian students. In addition, a considerable number of students from neighbouring countries attend institutions in Malaysia. Indeed, the facilities provided by the foreign institutions are often of a higher quality than those available in universities in neighbouring countries. These facilities are sometimes shared by institutions and the government also allows a small number of them to use public facilities, such as hospitals.

The government's objective is to produce a highly educated labour force for the new millennium and this ambition has meant that teaching staff are also benefiting from significant training and re-training.

### **Problems of higher education in countries in transition**

Gabor Szabo gave an overview of the problems facing the higher education sector in countries in economic transition in general but focusing primarily on the Hungarian situation. His comments linked in closely with those made by Mr Kiss in his opening address. There is one common feature among this group of countries, namely that the period immediately prior to 1990 was a time of party dictatorship. Although democracy has now been swept in across the region, education, especially higher education, will require much more time in terms of its transformation period.

The key challenge facing the higher education sector today in countries is that of financing. In terms of budgetary allocations, these are lower than those received by its counterparts in industrialised countries. As Mr Szabo explained: "The purse is smaller and the strings are tighter." States appear to be willing to shrug off their responsibility to fund the higher education sector and expect the institutions to find their own funding. This scenario may be possible in more prosperous economies but will only serve to seriously undermine higher education in countries in transition.

A problem that the Hungarian higher education sector has been attempting to deal with for some time has been the imbalance between the number of teachers and students - there are too few students. Part of this has been due to the lack of higher education courses, such as Bachelor-type degrees, for the masses. Steps are being undertaken to address this problem but there are fears of the impact of mass higher education on the aspect of quality.

The level of working conditions for higher education teachers varies from state to state among countries in transition. In Hungary, for example, they are civil

servants and their wage levels are only slightly higher than the national average wage. Union activity is possible in most countries for higher education employees. However, Mr Szabo noted that governments of countries in transition often cite tight budgets and economic difficulties as a counter-argument for not addressing union concerns in the higher education sector.

In closing, Mr Szabo pointed out that the importance of higher education is recognised in all countries in transition, but the slow pace of economic development is hampering reform and improvements in this sector. However, reform and restructure are pressing ahead in spite of these difficulties and the outlook for the future seems positive at this stage.

### **Steps to overcome the challenges to higher education**

In looking at the challenges facing higher education in developing countries and countries in transition and on the basis of the discussions, it was noted that several crucial steps were necessary to underpin any attempts to take on these challenges:

1. The establishment and maintenance of an environment of peace.
2. The establishment and maintenance of democracy.
3. An environment favouring economic development.
4. Increasing the percentage of GDP allocated to higher education and research to a level similar to that in industrialised countries.

### **Trade union action**

Within the framework of EI, a database has been developed on teachers' wages and conditions of employment in West European countries. It was proposed that this database should be enlarged to include information available in developing countries and countries in transition. Statistical analysis into the working conditions of teachers in these countries is key to improving the situation and the needs of these teachers are significant.

## Transnational higher education and faculty unions

### Distance education and socialisation

**G**lobalisation and the ICT revolution affect aspects of society and economy in nearly every country around the world today, including the higher education sector. Governments and corporations believe that the competitive nature of the global economy demands an educated work-force with emphasis on re-education and training. Discussions within the working group focused on a background paper prepared by Dr Perry Robinson, AFT, USA.

Distance and computer-based education have come to the fore in this respect. Technological developments have advanced to the level of being able provide science courses using virtual laboratories and simulation processes. However, with reference to the UK's Open University, a world-renowned institution in respect of distance education, it was noted that students still insist on meetings with tutors - human contact is still a high priority.

### Accreditation

It is essential that unions ensure that quality assurance regulations are applied to those institutions that provide distance education. In terms of quality assurance in the UK, the Open University is treated like any other educational institution. Problems will arise in respect of those institutions that provide transnational distance education and where it is unclear which country should be applying the quality control. Regulations will vary considerably between nations, further muddying the waters.

Accreditation and quality assurance formed a key focus for discussions during the workshop. For example, should professional agencies take care of quality assurance? How are education courses dealt with in terms of university accreditation? How do governments even know that a student has taken a particular course?

"Corporate universities" are also growing in significance. At the time of their creation, their main objective was to provide training for the employees of the founding corporation. However, most have expanded beyond training to granting college degrees and accepting a wider body of students.

It was suggested that the issue of regulation of educational institutions is crucial in the area of quality assurance. For example, in New Zealand, any institution wishing to call itself a "university" must meet certain criteria but the process is not closely monitored and regulations are not always enforced. Indeed, in some countries, there are no regulations governing the activities of some institutions which call themselves "universities" but which may only provide correspondence courses.

A new threat to the amount of funding available for traditional higher education institutions comes from the increasing number of Internet-based organisations a number of which are applying for regulatory status in order to receive funding.

## Undermining traditional institutions

These developments have placed enormous competitive pressures on traditional institutions. Education is fast becoming another economic sector subjected to market forces and influences and little else. ICT underpins the expansion of the availability and marketability of higher education and this has had considerable impact on teaching jobs and the standardisation of educational courses for software development. In addition, transnational education is being heavily promoted through the export market.

Participants agreed that there is a place for distance education in today's society. However, its existence should not lead to the dismantling of existing institutions. For example, because of the geographical shape and relatively small population of Norway, distance education is necessary to guarantee the basic rights of the population. However, unions would only support its development providing the courses were supplied through existing institutional structures and their teaching staff.

## Export markets - reality in developing countries

Developments in the field of education services are being further facilitated by activities in the WTO, particularly the negotiations on the removal of restrictions on international trade in services, which includes higher education. Countries are opening up their borders and student body to foreign institutions and higher education courses will become more widely available through information technology, particularly the Internet. The effects could be devastating on national universities and higher education institutions in countries which have agreed to lift trade restrictions.

This is a scenario which is being played out in Malaysia, as indicated earlier, where the government is openly encouraging foreign institutions to establish campuses in the country. A fundamental issue that concerns higher education staff in countries being swamped by foreign institutions is the subtle change of priorities among governments.

The ICT revolution is passing by a significant number of developing countries, thereby increasing the divide between North and South and condemning a large part of the world to a permanent game of catch-up. The Internet is a mythical creature in Ethiopia where the education infrastructure is deteriorating. Although the World Bank project to create the African Virtual University has now been set up in Addis Ababa, it is still only available to an elite minority. Ethiopia is a huge country and the majority of its population is very poor. Very few young people make it to university and even those who do might not be able to study in their preferred fields due to the lack of places and teachers.

Compounding these serious problems is the lack of basic freedoms and disregard for fundamental human rights in various countries throughout the world.

A further source of concern for higher education trade unions world-wide is the alliance of national and international organisations, often co-operating with



corporations and profit-based institutions, which establish educational policy for the global and regional flow of distance education. An example of this is the Global Alliance for Transnational Education (GATE) which has developed principles for transnational education and developed a certification process for providers and receivers of this form of education. GATE, of course, is particularly interested in the debate in the WTO affecting the liberalisation of services.

## Intellectual property

The rapid growth of the Internet has presented new challenges for national intellectual property laws and international agreements. Serious questions are raised over fundamental issues such as copyright and patent laws and legal jurisdictions. The US universities claim ownership of their teaching staff's inventions and patents through a provision in the Copyright Act entitled "work-for-hire". In simple terms, this means that if a worker invents or creates something in the course of his or her work then the employer owns it because the worker was "hired" to do that. This same provision could also be applied to research activities and intellectual property.

The intellectual property of teachers and researchers is a valuable commodity in the global economy, particularly in its application to educational software development. Participants from Quebec explained that universities were producing educational programme packages to sell to other countries claiming that anything produced in the institution "belonged" to the university itself.

Education unions are concerned that this trend could spread globally as higher education services develop internationally. Collective bargaining is considered a powerful means of defending the intellectual property rights of workers and establishing standard academic practice. Indeed, in Quebec it is only in those universities where there are pre-existing agreements protecting academic freedom that unions can defend their members' interests.

Unions need to consider the relevance of "moral rights" in this area as every individual should have moral rights over what they create and these should be protected in national legislation. Nevertheless, with the advance of the Internet and the fact that many institutions have their own Internet servers, the whole sphere of moral rights is becoming blurred. It was suggested that a more practical union approach would be to look at sharing intellectual property between creator and employer.

It is clear that this situation differs widely across the globe. The situation is more secure in Spain and Portugal where teachers maintain ownership of their intellectual property and often sell their work using the university as a marketing tool. However, in some developing countries, the area of intellectual property is often abused by the authorities. Most research is carried out through government funding and the government keeps ownership of the research results.

The response should not be to seek a blanket protection of intellectual property through copyright regulations. This would severely disadvantage developing countries where institutions and individuals would not be able to afford to pay copyright fees. If education is to be free for all then a special mechanism would have to be developed in terms of the copyright applied to developing countries.

Failure to take into account the special needs of these countries could result in their destabilisation as students look more and more to foreign countries for their education needs.

In New Zealand, it was noted that the results of privately contracted research can sometimes be kept secret if the contractor considers it commercially viable to do so. In these cases, unions have had difficulty in convincing members to act against the condition of secrecy. The issue of secrecy raised interesting debate within the working group. For example, in Sweden, all research results must be published within a specified time period, but delay mechanisms can be employed. Teachers in Norway own the results of their research.

The issue of secrecy is even more pronounced in France where PhD students must sign an official form which ensures that they keep their work and research secret even after leaving university. The defence of a PhD by a student is also confidential.

Another area under attack is that of individual privacy when using an institution's computer communications system, either intranet or the Internet. Ownership of the system gives administrations the capacity to monitor the use of the system by individuals, including e-mail facilities.

The ICT revolution has resulted in a widening of the North-South divide in terms of both wealth and knowledge. The new era will certainly increase the disparity between educational institutions in the developed and developing countries. The problem is due mainly to the limited telecommunications infrastructure in developing countries which cannot support distance education as a principal method of improving and expanding higher education.

### Trade union action

*Quality control.* It was noted that a considerable amount of research has been carried out into higher education and the ICT revolution. However, how useful is this research and how well does it respond to the concerns of education unions? It was suggested that trade unions be more proactive in analysing research of this nature and publishing the results. In particular, unions should focus on how to protect students through stricter quality control.

*Regulatory framework for distance education.* In respect of the discussion on quality control, participants from Australia called for a more balanced approach between the need for regulation and the need for flexibility. This requires broadening the sphere of the regulatory framework to cover more than quality assurance and include such areas as governance and the financial viability of institutions.

*Research into failures of distance education.* Technology has its drawbacks which deserve as much attention as its more positive effects. Many distance courses demand state-of-the-art computer equipment which can result in students getting into debt to purchase and maintain them. In addition, it was noted in the USA that the drop-out rate in distance education courses is as high as 50 per cent, but research has not been conducted into why so many students drop out.

*Awareness-raising campaign.* How well do people around the world understand the concept of distance education? This fundamental point was raised by participants from developing countries where people have a very limited understanding, if any, of this field of education. It was suggested that EI develop awareness-raising campaign material with affiliates to explain the background, focus and future of distance education, highlighting particularly the concerns of trade unions. EI should also begin to consider how to influence the international community to help developing nations build the systems and capacity for distance education.

*Organising campaign.* Unions should begin to develop strategies on how to organise the new of ICT education workers. This is a rapidly growing unorganised work-force and it is essential that unions begin to establish dialogue with them as a beginning to efforts to recruit them into membership. Failure to do so may hamper union campaigns to regulate the expansion of higher education services through new technology.

*Protection of intellectual property.* While there are positive aspects in respect of distance education, it is proving difficult to exert any form of control or monitoring system over what is being offered through Internet services. The key to monitoring Internet activity is intellectual property and its protection. EI and its affiliates should develop policy, strategies and activities on the protection of intellectual property focusing in particular on Internet-provided educational services.

*Guidelines for best practice.* Participants agreed that unions are facing a dilemma in this area. While some countries openly encourage distance education providers, others are concerned about the protection of jobs, the introduction of atypical forms of employment and uncontrolled exportation of educational courses and services. However, the demand that should underpin union activity is that appropriate standards and regulations should be developed in terms of definition of distance education. It was also suggested that EI develop a set of guidelines of best practice in this field.

*WTO.* There was a significant debate on the forthcoming meeting of the WTO entitled "The Millennium Round" in Seattle, USA, in December 1999. The discussions focused on the further liberalisation of trade in services and the inclusion of education in the definition of "services". Considerable controversy surrounds education being included in the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) and the union position is to have education withdrawn completely. Given the proximity of the Millennium Round, it was agreed that EI affiliates should mobilise to force their governments to clarify their position in the debate and to inform the general public in detail of the stakes involved. As a result of the discussion, a resolution was drafted and subsequently adopted by the full conference on the WTO Millennium Round (see Annex 2).

It was agreed that each union would organise various high profile activities prior to the WTO meeting and these efforts would be synchronised internationally to enhance their impact. In addition, the New Zealand affiliate (AUS) indicated that it would produce a guide to assist EI affiliates in understanding the language used in the WTO material. Participants agreed that it would be important to share good quality information in order to guarantee the success of the campaign.

## University governance, academic freedom, autonomy and social change

A background paper prepared by Dr Maureen Killeavy of IFUT, Ireland, pointed out that the procedures and structures of university governance, academic freedom, autonomy and social responsibility have become inextricably linked with the extension of higher education to greater numbers of students and the increasing demand on government funding to finance the university sector.

Recent legislation in a number of countries has been concerned with attempts to ensure that governmental regulations for higher education institutions would include certain measures designed to initiate and promote social policies, particularly with regard to combating educational disadvantage and quality assurance procedures. Issues of institutional accountability in Europe and the US have become increasingly significant with economic deregulation.

### Academic freedom and/or autonomy?

The tradition of academic freedom guaranteed by the autonomy of the institution is an essential right and function of a university. Academics with permanent teaching posts in such institutions traditionally have tenure. While the autonomy of the university does not guarantee academic freedom, academic freedom requires that university institutions be autonomous. A number of workshop participants reported the damaging effects on academic freedom through a lessening of the rights enshrined in tenure. Participants from New Zealand, the United Kingdom and Spain stated that these rights had been undermined. The governments of these particular countries have exempted themselves from Article 9 of the UNESCO Recommendation on the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel.

It was emphasised that academic freedom and university autonomy are crucial in a democracy. It is therefore important that they should be codified and enshrined in legislation. While it is the duty of universities to take social needs into account, it must never be forgotten that the right to academic freedom must be protected or society as a whole will suffer the consequences. In a number of developing countries, for example the Ivory Coast, academic freedom and the autonomy of the university are highly valued by academics but are not yet part of the legislative framework.

There was also broad consensus that tenure was necessary if academic freedom is to be maintained. Participants agreed that these two elements were closely linked. Unions are concerned at the impact of the recent legislative developments in New Zealand in this regard. Disquiet was expressed concerning the lessening of former rights of tenure in the UK and Sweden. Academics may be dismissed in these countries if institutions successfully plead a lack of resources to maintain employment. This situation is open to abuse in relation to tenure.

With the weakening to the rights of tenure in some countries and the "casualisation" of academic employment, an increasingly lower proportion of university teachers have the type of tenured appointments which would allow them to exercise academic freedom without fear of dismissal. Participants stated

that it would be desirable to extend academic freedom to non-tenured academics. This might be accomplished through collective agreements in the various countries. The solidarity of tenured staff who have academic freedom in support of the right to academic freedom of all university teachers would be essential in this campaign.

The value of academic freedom to society generally is greater today than ever before. It is the duty of unions in the higher education and research sector to ensure that society recognises its importance. Participants emphasised that academic freedom is as important as freedom of the press and the separation of powers in safeguarding democracy.

A quote from one participant summed up the overall feeling of workshop participants: "Without academic freedom electricity would never have been invented ... we would just have improved candlelight."

### **Influence of international organisations**

International organisations, such as the World Bank and UNESCO on the one hand and multinational corporations on the other, exert significant direct and indirect influence on universities. The World Bank has complained that governments have not been implementing fully the programmes it has prescribed in loan agreements, particularly its operational education model. Trade unions have long been campaigning against the full implementation of World Bank programmes in so far as they have a negative impact on socio-economic factors and the public sector, especially the health and education services. The World Bank is in the unacceptable position of being able to employ a "carrot and stick" strategy in influencing the policy and legislative actions of certain governments.

In addition, in many developing countries, dedicated funding for academic work often depends on the goodwill or whim of international organisations and multinational corporations. As governments become less able to meet the increasing financial costs of funding education, the tendency to turn to international organisations for assistance is becoming stronger. Unions are concerned at the level of influence these organisations can then exert on policy decisions in the education sector, particularly in such impoverished regions as Sub-Saharan Africa.

Universities must remain or become forums for reflection in the new millennium. They should aim to achieve true democratisation, promote access to higher education and preserve and strengthen quality. The university can only exercise its most fundamental social responsibility if its academic freedom is maintained. One of the major challenges facing universities internationally is the balancing and maintenance of academic freedom while at the same time ensuring that their social responsibilities are fulfilled. The key to sustainable growth and development are co-operation and the protection of human rights. In education, one of the most important human rights is academic freedom underpinned by the autonomy of university institutions.

### Trade union action

EI and its affiliates should campaign to ensure that all governments respect and fully implement UNESCO Recommendation on the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel. In particular, participants drafted a recommendation in which EI was called upon to request the Director General of UNESCO to immediately implement Article 75 of the UNESCO Recommendation (see Annex 3).

It was also suggested that networks be established comprising Ministers of Education and organisations such as EI to bring pressure to bear on international organisations involved in financial assistance programmes for the education sector in developing countries. These networks should be in a position to take a firm and public stand against any detrimental influences which might be exerted on higher education institutions.

## Salary determination and collective bargaining

On the basis of a background paper prepared by Graham McCulloch, NTEU, Australia, working group participants looked at how and why salary determination and collective bargaining has developed over the years for teaching staff in higher education. In this respect, it is important to consider the context of the provision of mass higher education today which is due to three fundamental factors:

- unprecedented industrial and economic growth;
- high demand for access to education;
- increasing demand for highly educated workers.

Of course, these developments have had a significant impact on both higher education employees and the institutions themselves. In particular, benefits have fallen in relation to other unionised professions. Employees have also suffered cuts in the time available for research and discretionary academic activities. As has occurred in other sectors in recent years, a new management culture has been implanted into the higher education sector which has effectively centralised administrative decision-making and begun to reshape institutions into profit-making businesses.

The workloads of higher education employees have risen considerably while state support has declined. This combination has had an inevitable knock-on effect on the quality of education. Academic freedom has also come under attack from increased commercialism and the growing need for institutions to find private funding sources.

### Centralised and decentralised bargaining

While the situation varies significantly between countries, it is clear that to a greater or lesser degree all unions are facing similar problems. The problems facing unions in developing countries and countries in transition are exacerbated by the inability of the state to guarantee continued investment in higher education, including the payment of wages, for example, in the Russian Federation. From the workshop discussions, it soon became clear that effective collective bargaining, whether “centralised” or “decentralised”, depends on adequate funding in the higher education sector.

In industrialised countries, there are ongoing pressures to “decentralise” collective bargaining processes. This approach is well entrenched in North America, Australia and New Zealand. In Europe, there are various moves to modify national bargaining arrangements to accommodate local negotiations on employment conditions. Some of these local processes involve various forms of supplementary payments, loadings and merit payments, while others regulate non-financial matters such as teaching loads or work organisation.

For countries in transition, funding problems are acute. For example, in Hungary, a professor’s salary is only 10 per cent of the European Union average, and legally

binding agreements cannot be implemented because the state has no capacity to meet the costs of salary improvements or to maintain employment levels.

Given the diversity of national approaches to industrial regulation and collective bargaining in the higher education sector, it is difficult to make comparisons. Differences in taxation and social security systems also affect any comparative exercise.

### **Trade union action**

El can play a role in providing information and resources to its members. Suggested initiatives included:

- the production of country reports describing the collective bargaining system for each higher education affiliate;
- the establishment of an international database on salaries and working conditions and a larger or more detailed conference or workshop on collective bargaining issues - this might be organised as part of El's next international higher education conference. It was also suggested that a database might include emerging trends as well as historical time-series. Data should encompass both salaries and benefits and non-financial bargaining issues such as intellectual property, tenure, contracts, workloads and academic freedom.



## Diversity, discrimination and career development paths

The workshop, chaired by Roch Denis of the FQPPU, Canada, covered a wide range of topics focusing on issues related to access and opportunities for women and minority groups in the higher education sector. The word "diverse" in itself means many different things to different people. Higher education teachers are a diverse group, as are students and even higher education itself. Indeed, one of its basic features is its diversity. Participants agreed that this diversity has to be acknowledged and accepted before dealing with the key issue of discrimination in higher education. Although the context may change from country to country, the issue of discrimination is topical throughout the globe and is relevant to all EI member organisations.

A fundamental factor underpinning this debate is the problem of diversity as opposed to discrimination. This point was raised early on in the workshop. Diversification of higher education, its structures, content and methodology introduces greater democracy, but care should be taken not to allow it to introduce hierarchies in higher education. Therefore, trade unions should work to promote diversification but prevent the establishment of hierarchies. By allowing greater access to higher education, society will begin to address the issue of reducing social discrimination.

### Discrimination in academic profession

Every employee in the higher education sector should benefit from the fundamental right of being able to advance in his or her profession. However, in analysing higher education careers, it is evident that discrimination exists and acts as a significant obstacle to many workers in the progression of their careers. In the UK, it was reported that discrimination already occurs at the point of entry into the academic profession. In France, it tends to occur during the career progression of women - there are few women in the top positions in the sector. This insidious aspect to discrimination makes it all the more harmful.

Racial discrimination is also widespread and this problem was highlighted in a number of countries. In the USA, although it is difficult for women to progress in higher education careers, it is even worse for minority groups. Employment of women and minority groups is concentrated in part-time and non-tenured positions. A particular problem raised by delegates from Quebec was where university professors actually employ other academic staff to work in their departments and the union was concerned about the level of job security and the respect of fundamental labour rights of these employees.

There are situations in the USA where employers will offer higher salaries to those from minority groups or women - the objective being to offer financial incentives to increase the numbers of women and minority groups employed in the higher education sector. In other cases, university departments may be offered bonus positions by the administration if they employ a woman or someone from a minority group. There are also private foundations which will sponsor doctorate students who are planning an academic career on the basis that these students must come from minority groups.

Belgian delegates pointed out that immigrants are discriminated against in terms of becoming a teacher as legislation stipulates that to apply for a teaching post one should either be of Belgian or another EU nationality.

Delegates from France suggested that discrimination should be dealt with in the labour market where it is particularly harmful. When applying for posts in the French public sector, applications are anonymous so that employers are unaware of who the person is. It was suggested that the same procedure should be applied in the case of higher education.

Participants agreed that awareness-raising and member education were both very important in forcing change. This point was underlined by a Norwegian delegate who reported that, in an attempt to address the limited number of full-time female professors, the union discussed approaching the government to demand the allocation of a specific number of such positions for women. This proposal was finally voted out by young women activists on the union's executive board. The need for membership education was also underlined by delegates from New Zealand where there is a problem of obtaining support for increasing the numbers of indigenous Maori people employed in higher education.

The situation in developing countries is made considerably worse through the very limited number of girls who actually attend schools. Not only are women discriminated against in higher education careers, but there are very few women who are even qualified to apply for such positions. In the Ivory Coast, the ratio of sophomore students in universities is 76:24 in favour of men and there are no women in any of the top positions in higher education institutions.

## Exclusion

Participants considered the issue of access to higher education as millions of individuals world-wide are excluded. A fundamental factor raised by delegates from New Zealand was the cost of studying in today's industrialised and market-oriented countries, especially in post-graduate education. In New Zealand, for example, it takes an average of 51 years for women to repay loans for post-graduate studies. The average for men is 17 years. This has had a major impact on the number of women in post-graduate education. The union is looking at addressing this situation through ongoing inquiries into academic freedom and equity issues. The union will present the results to the government and international agencies pointing out where they have breached their commitments to academic freedom and equity.

The issue of the cost of education is becoming more serious in countries in transition where it is becoming very difficult financially for families to be able to afford higher education. In Hungary, the cost of equipment and materials is very high and thousands of young people, especially women, are excluded from going on to higher education.

Delegates from Belgium noted that because of the country being in the first wave of EU Member States in European and Monetary Union (EMU), severe financial limitations have been imposed by the government with particular economic discrimination towards the higher education sector. This has resulted in a two-

tiered system in Belgium where the public higher education institutions are underfunded, offer limited services and hire teachers with limited qualifications. The private institutions on the other hand are better funded, are better able to provide higher quality services and the staff receive better conditions and benefits.

### Unions and discrimination

It was pointed out that in Europe it has been the trade unions and not the employers who have raised the issue of discrimination and the need for action to be taken. Trade unions should mobilise to force employers to put appropriate structures in place to tackle the issue. Due to national differences in terms of culture, society, language, legal frameworks and so on, it will not be possible to develop a one-size fits all strategy, but rather a series of principles should be established which unions in different countries should consider how and if they can be applied.

Picking up on the need to develop membership education, participants emphasised the need for union members to be personally committed to action against discrimination. Unions need to consider what can be done to move the agenda forward and to be inclusive in these deliberations. Special focus should be given to the education of young people and in developing closer relations with highly qualified individuals in the sector who have a tendency to be somewhat "elitist" in their communications and relations.

Trade unions must also look very closely at their own structures to ensure that the voices of those "excluded" are heard. If minority groups and women, as active or potential members of a union, do not have a say in union programme development and activities, then the union is not responding to those needs. If unions are to maintain a credible profile in the fight against discrimination then they must be seen to be looking closely at their structures, policies and allocation of resources in the process.

A number of unions already have specific structures to discuss women's issues. The problem is often more one of not properly implementing declarations which have been adopted. However, care should be taken not to allow the establishment of union committees for women and minority groups to become little more than token gestures. It is important that a conscious effort is made by the leadership of trade unions, universities and faculties to tackle the issue of discrimination. After an extended period of conscious effort, this will eventually become part of the culture of the union, university or faculty. The National Education Association (NEA) in the USA is an example of this effort. The union's culture is to look for diversity in its structures. In addition, the NEA applies the same principles in terms of hiring its own staff and its collective bargaining procedures.

## Trade union action

El affiliates must take the initiative in combating all forms of discrimination. Participants suggested that closer examination should be conducted and a permanent structure should be put in place on discrimination, equality and diversity in higher education, for example, by establishing an international working group within El.

The working group also recommended that research should focus on the stakes involved in diversity, equality and discrimination. They proposed that information on these should be better and more widely disseminated, for example, through annual surveys on the situation of equality and discrimination and its development.

In the immediate, the working group called on union organisations to totally oppose the destabilisation of employment and the increase of precarious contracts, yet another source of discrimination. Participants raised concerns on employment for young and old. In France, for example, older people are discriminated against as the Ministry for Education prefers to hire younger people. It was suggested that unions should adopt a common position and reject any argument that a job should belong to a particular group, young, old or minorities.

As a first positive step forward, the group emphasised the need for unions to implement the principles of equality within their own structures and institutions.

El should ensure that information is shared and disseminated between affiliates regarding union experiences, strategies and policies on discrimination. This point was reinforced by several participants and it was recommended that information on particularly innovative ideas used by unions in this field should be made widely available. In addition, it was suggested that El should identify union action with special symbolic value in the fight against discrimination and in which all member organisations across the globe could participate. The aim would be to identify action which is high profile, concrete and with the capacity to impact upon society and government. Trade unions should be prepared to invest in research and analysis to guarantee a comprehensive level of consistency and coherency in their efforts.

El should also consider organising specific forums on diversity and the battle against discrimination. In addition, it should be aware of and work to eliminate any forms of discrimination in union structures and activities. In the long run, in association with the other education sectors, El should aim to implement a plan of action for equality and against all forms of discrimination.

## Research and research funding

### Public and private funding sources

In his background paper for this working group, Dr Bert Fredriksson, SULF, Sweden, stated that modern research requires highly trained researchers, qualified associates, suitable premises, computers, scientific equipment, in many cases extremely advanced materials for experiments, and much more. In essence, today's research requires considerable financial investment. Indeed, this aspect also drives research policy and planning. Financing, access to and influence over resources are thus crucial to research.

In a majority of countries, the government has the main responsibility for pure research and often invests in various applied research projects. Businesses fund research which will primarily affect their own corporate interests. Within the OECD, research and development companies are involved in a growing proportion of research projects. Funds for public research have been cut back in most countries, but there have been signs recently of a change in this trend and an increased commitment being shown to research projects. Workshop participants emphasised the need for more resources to be allocated to research, especially to basic research.

Developments in publicly financed research are largely directed by what research will prove to be "useful", for example, in terms of social relevance. This is especially true in respect of new resources for research. To a certain extent, this development reflects today's information society. But it also reflects short-term expectations placed on the findings of research.

However, it is essential that resources are made available for pure research for the free, long-term pursuit of knowledge. Pure research is a matter of great import. Because it is a long-term investment and is characterised by uncertainties, it does require considerable financing and it is difficult to identify other sources than the state. Picking up on these points, participants underlined the need for a balance between basic and applied research.

The risk of short-sighted research funding and demands for quick results could lead to projects being built on existing knowledge in order to simply establish business patents. Such projects would not take into account the importance of the long-term value of research and new knowledge. This situation also trivialises university research.

### Working conditions

The issue of financing is also very important when looking at the conditions under which researchers work. The shift today is towards project financing and fixed financing for research in higher education institutions is becoming more infrequent. This shift brings with it the risk that important research will not receive financial support.

These developments undermine the research profession and their working conditions. In order to attract good researchers, they must be offered good

working conditions and receive decent remuneration. This will require adequate resources for research projects and the possibility for researchers to interact with other research workers world-wide.

The direction of research financing is also important for university teachers. The balance between pure and socially relevant research is not only a policy matter, it also concerns teachers and their representative organisations. Underpinning the work of university teachers is academic freedom, yet current developments in research financing mean less scope for free research.

The ever-increasing volume of short-term financing means that many institutions are reluctant to offer anything other than short-term research positions. In addition, the proportion of tenured staff is declining and, among others, this means that it takes a long time before a postgraduate will obtain a permanent position at a university. This affects recruitment in so far as good candidates will not apply for insecure jobs with poor working conditions. The integrity and security of tenured positions are key to good research results.

### Trade union action

The workshop emphasised the importance for trade unions to focus on the commercialisation of university research and the need for permanent positions for researchers to be established as normal practice (see Annex 4).

Participants also noted the lack of social protection for researchers working on short-term contracts and underlined the need for unions to pay close attention to this issue in future collective bargaining rounds. Priority should be given to re-establish employment security for university teachers.

Concern was expressed about the situation of young research workers who often face difficulties in career development because of the lack of resources and effective supervision. Participants insisted that governments should provide additional funding for young research workers. They need good quality and effective training and a career system that will stimulate good researchers to devote themselves to their work.

It was suggested that joint PhD programmes should be elaborated between developing and developed countries. In addition, international research funds should be made available for developing countries and co-operation should be encouraged between research students in developing and developed countries.

The workshop called for closer examination of the academic freedom of researchers and underlined the need for unions to ensure that this fundamental right is respected. Society demands that new areas of research be developed. Therefore, the systems of research financing and career development should be more closely analysed and discussed from the trade union perspective.

## Higher education and research unions and the broader trade union movement

The popularisation of higher education and research, the promotion of customer-oriented research, mounting threats to academic careers and working conditions and the underlying trend towards globalisation confirm that academic labour is firmly linked to the interests of organised labour generally. This is demonstrated by the ongoing debate on trade in services within the WTO which will include higher education (see Annex 2).

On the basis of a background paper prepared by Paul Bennett, NATFHE, UK, looking at where higher education and research unions stand in relation to general education unions and the wider trade union movement, workshop participants discussed existing relations in their various countries. It became clear that there is no single model appropriate to all circumstances and that relations were determined by a range of social, cultural and historical factors. It also depends upon the stage of development of individual countries and their trade union movements.

### Trade union action

During discussions, there were strong arguments both for and against dedicated higher education and research unions on the one hand, and inclusion of this specific group of workers in general teachers' unions on the other. However, it was suggested quite forcefully that all academic staff below the most senior management levels should be integrated into membership. Unions which include both academic and general staff reported that this had strong mutual advantages for both groups of workers after initial doubts had been overcome.

Whatever forms unions take for higher education and research workers, they must be responsive to changes in their external environment. As regards unions in developing countries, experience suggests that there is value in incorporating higher education personnel within broader trade union structures in order to handle the wide-ranging political and social challenges they face.

Union activists in higher education and research must build appropriate links at all levels: with branch or local associations, in the national union or trade union centre and at the regional and global levels. Examples were given of countries with federal and decentralised budgetary and policymaking structures, for example in North America, which required different responses from the unions and, in some cases, distinguished higher education unions' needs from their counterparts in the schools.

It was argued that one of the strengths of higher education unions in many countries was the fact that their local structures are firmly based in each higher education institution, with some unions having their own overtly federal structure. In any case, union structures should avoid the danger of national structures becoming remote from their membership base. Particular initiatives and structures need to be developed to meet the needs and reflect the views of specialist groups, like research staff, within a predominantly teachers' organisation.

Whatever their organisational form, higher education and research unions need to build strong links with primary and secondary education unions. This will help in achieving a holistic position on education and bargaining issues and should also prevent governments from playing one sector off against another, for example, on educational funding or privatisation.

Higher education and research unions need to build alliances with all other trade union sectors from local through to international level. These need to be built on a foundation of solidarity and mutual support, particularly in the field of collective bargaining. Alliances are also important to ensure that the issues and views of the higher education and research unions, for example, on lifelong learning or the status of academic staff, are included on the wider trade union agenda.

The workshop explored the "social partnership" industrial relations model, dominant in western Europe, and agreed that while it had many strengths, unions needed to be aware of its negative aspects. In particular, unions should strongly defend their interests and avoid processes being taken over by the priorities of regional agencies or governments with funds at their disposal to promote their own agendas. 'Partnership' should not be at the expense of trade union independence.

The need to maintain and build trade unions for higher education and research employees was emphasised. Reference was made to initiatives in some countries to prioritise union recruitment work and to develop specialist cadres for this activity. Trade unions must actively recruit students and young people, including those who are working on campuses in any capacity. Organising young workers will help offset the threat of graduate students being used by employers as a source of inexpensive labour. Members, either new or existing, should not be taken for granted and unions should promote the benefits of membership.

Finally, workshop participants recognised the importance of working through EI on relations with international agencies such as the World Bank, WTO and the OECD. In addition, EI itself must build alliances with other trade union groups, for example, public sector unions and professional workers' unions with similar interests to teachers.



## Higher education and research union strategies in EI

**B**elow is a synthesis of the outcome of the three workshops on the background paper prepared by Paul Bennett, NATFHE, UK. Variants of similar ideas but with different emphasis emerged in the three groups.

### Trade union action

There is scope for greater co-operation between higher education and research unions at the regional level, for example, the Mare Balticum Conferences in Northern Europe. Such activities, generated by member organisations, can benefit from EI involvement and EI itself can also improve its public profile and its own working capacity by associating itself and lending its name to events in this way.

EI should take the lead in promoting or facilitating such activities between industrialised and developing countries. Some national level activities can also benefit from EI representation where this is possible and appropriate. Participants noted the particular experience of Europe with a strong EI regional committee for higher education and research, together with the possibility of establishing similar bodies in other regions where conditions allowed.

It is a matter for the higher education and research unions themselves to establish their needs and the action programmes required to meet them at the regional and international levels, within EI budgetary constraints. The higher education and research sector is one of the most internationally active, fastest changing and possibly fastest growing sectors of EI. It also acts as the driving force of economic and technical development, as well as generating change elsewhere in the education system through its role in teacher education.

A range of short, medium and long-term actions were identified.

#### Short-term

- Members will produce an up-dated e-mail list in co-operation with the EI Secretariat.
- A higher education and research Internet web site will be developed.
- Urgent action on the WTO meeting in Seattle in December 1999 is necessary.
- Unions in the sector will respond to the current EI review of structure and governance in the coming months to ensure that the voice of the sector is heard.

On all these urgent tasks, volunteers to take the lead in the work were identified among workshop participants.

#### Medium-term

- It was agreed that the active support of unions in the sector was required for activities in the Action Programme for 2000, in particular regional meetings of unions in Africa and in the OECD countries. The proposal that the OECD union meeting might be held in the OECD headquarters building in Paris was welcomed. Participants recognised that the Task Group set up by EI had only a

limited capacity to do the work with the EI Secretariat to achieve programme activities. It did not have sufficient representation from the non-industrialised countries which is partly a reflection of the regional imbalance of EI member organisations and structures.

- More general discussion took place on the representative role and basis of the present Task Force. There was agreement that the representation of higher education and research unions within EI needs to be strengthened. One proposal was to establish a representative group with parallel steps being taken to develop regional higher education and research union capacity and representation in the non-industrialised regions. This would help EI to develop greater capacity to articulate the views of higher education and research members in the non-industrialised countries.
- This group should not be a formal constitutional body of EI, but it should have the capacity to work on the higher education policy of EI. It should also ensure that authoritative actions and responses are made possible which reflect the views and experience of unions in the sector. Costs could be kept down by meeting on dates adjacent to other global or regional events and for members of the committee from developing countries to be given financial and other support to attend. In any event, it was recognised that the regular meetings now built into the EI Action Programme could provide an important impetus for the development of co-ordinated positions on higher education and research work within EI.
- EI should also take steps to ensure direct representation of the sector on its Executive Board. Options include a higher education Vice-Presidency and a dedicated higher education position on the Board. Participants recognised the need to agree the most effective and practicable way of achieving sectoral representation and to lobby with other EI affiliates in order to achieve this objective. It was felt that this should be pursued through written contributions to the EI structural review. Participants of one working group agreed to elaborate these ideas.
- Specific steps should be taken to assist higher education and research unions in non-industrialised countries. This includes capacity-building through contacts between unions in non-industrialised and industrialised regions. In addition, proactive strategies to build democracy and promote respect for human and trade union rights should be developed alongside specific actions to defend particular members in danger. Reference was made to this conference themes of academic freedom and institutional autonomy as issues of particular importance to the sector and unions in non-industrialised countries. Global agendas must better reflect the needs of the non-industrialised countries. Generally, EI's regional capacity in higher education and research must be strengthened, but not at the expense of a global perspective.
- Participants agreed that higher education and research were in the forefront of the commercialisation of education. Unions should concentrate on this challenge and prioritise their work accordingly. On this and other issues, affiliates must take responsibility for interacting with EI and other affiliates. In turn, EI must communicate more quickly and fully to affiliates on important structural issues.

Long-term

- Workshops agreed on the value of the current three-year programme and emphasised that the substantive action programme must not be jeopardised in future by the funding of structural proposals if budgeting constraints threaten activities in the sector.

## Conclusion

On the threshold of the 21st century, the trade union movement faces a number of significant challenges which have considerable implications for its future structure and operations. This 2nd El International Conference on Higher Education and Research provided affiliates in these sectors with a timely opportunity to discuss some of these issues and particularly those affecting their members and threatening their professions.

Delegates supported the call for monitored controls on the quality aspect of higher education. The danger of the ICT revolution, which is constantly and rapidly evolving, is that it undermines the possibility to apply appropriate regulations in terms of quality and ownership. It also impacts upon the fundamental trade union and professional rights of educators and researchers. In addition, concern was expressed in respect of the opening of national frontiers to higher education providers world-wide, particularly in view of the lack of regulatory controls. Delegates called on El and its affiliates to be vigilant in the light of the expansion such operations in developing countries to ensure that quality education services are provided which complement those already available and that existing working conditions for higher education teachers are not adversely affected.

Crucial to any strategy that may be elaborated in this respect is the need for global and regional networks of El affiliates and other interested organisations, such as UNESCO. The exchange of information on policy and strategy in the light of these developments must underpin the development of an El plan of action.

Despite the rapid development of new technology, it would seem that the concept of distance education and the technologies it incorporates remain relatively unknown, and certainly unchallenged, in a number of developing countries. In addition, the majority of workers in the various distance education industries, both in developing and developed countries, are not trade union members and are largely unaware of the benefits of union membership. El and its affiliates have a responsibility to their members and society as a whole to promote awareness on distance education and what it means for the higher education and research sector. In addition, it is critical that unions in these sectors develop organising campaigns to attract workers in the new industries into membership to encourage solidarity and support.

Special attention was paid to the follow-up of the UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel which was frequently referenced in many of the discussions during the conference. In particular, El and its affiliates should focus efforts on Article 75 of the Recommendation which requires UNESCO to prepare a full report on the global situation with regard to academic freedom and the respect of the rights of these workers. It is essential that El ascertains which UNESCO Member States have submitted reports and co-ordinates efforts with national affiliates to ensure that these reports are made widely available. Where reports have not been submitted, El should work with affiliates to urge governments to comply.

The ever-changing environment of industrial relations in the higher education sector should be the subject of close attention of El and its affiliates. The tool

that can be extremely effective to unions world-wide in keeping pace with developments in this area is that of information. The situation varies considerably from country to country and, likewise, a vast array of union strategies have been established to face these challenges. In this respect, all EI affiliates should prepare comprehensive reports for wider distribution and, in addition, EI itself should establish an international database on salaries, working conditions and other aspects such as intellectual property and tenure.

A similar exercise should be conducted in the field of diversity, equality and discrimination. In this context, a recurring development was raised on many occasions within working groups, namely, the destabilisation of employment and the increasing number of precarious contracts. This problem applies to a wide range of industries in the services sector where the globalisation of the economy has had the most significant impact. Education has not been spared, particularly in view of the attempt by various bodies, including the WTO, to redefine it as an integral part of the services sector. Trade unions are especially concerned by this development and delegates reinforced the call on EI and all its affiliates to monitor developments within the WTO and the positions of Member States.

The impact of economic deregulation and the commercialisation process has also been heavy in the field of research and delegates underlined the need for trade union intervention to stem the destabilisation of research employment. Short-term contracts are becoming more popular with employers, facilitating the trend for them to avoid shouldering their social responsibilities towards this largely unprotected group of workers. Employment security is as important in the research sector as in other areas of higher education. Special attention should also be paid to the treatment of young workers. Academic freedom is key for workers in research and higher education and EI and its affiliates must ensure that this fundamental right is respected throughout the world.

The arrival of the new millennium brings with it much uncertainty and apprehension in terms of socio-economic development. The ICT revolution has been massive and deep in terms of its impact on the world of work, society and government. The trade union movement must review and redevelop its own position, structures, policies and strategies in the light of the globalisation process. Education, and especially higher education, has the most crucial role to play in social and economic progress in the 21st century. In order that the sector and those it employs can fulfil their role, appropriate steps should be taken to guarantee the full respect of their fundamental rights and freedoms and the provision of adequate working conditions.

Delegates to this conference acknowledged the importance of the task before them and strove hard to develop a focused trade union response which would guide the work of EI and its affiliates in the coming years. Underpinning this plan of action is the need for continued and strengthened solidarity and the development of an enhanced communications network.

## Conference Programme

### *Thursday 23 September*

- 10:00                    Opening session
- Welcoming remarks by Gabor Borbath, General Secretary of SEH
  - Welcoming remarks by Gabor Szabo, International Secretary of FDSZ
  - Opening remarks by Fred van Leeuwen, El General Secretary
- 10:30                    Komlavi F. Seddoh, Director, Higher Education Division, UNESCO
- 12:00                    Kiss Adam Vice Secretary of State, Hungary
- 15:00 - 15:30            Presentation of the afternoon workshops
- 15:30 - 18:30            Workshops
1. Information technology/distance education and extraterritorial providers
  2. University governance/Academic freedom, autonomy and social responsibility
  3. Salary determination/Aims of Collective bargaining

### *Friday 24 September*

- 09:00 - 10:30           Higher education challenges for developing countries and countries in transition
- Komlavi F. Seddoh, Director, Higher Education Division, UNESCO and former Ministry of Education, Togo
  - Gabor Szabo, Trade Union of Employees in Higher Education FDSZ (Hungary)
- 11:00 - 12:30           Higher education challenges for developing countries and countries in transition - Round Table  
Moderator Janez Stergar ESWUS  
Mr Seddoh, Mr Szabo, Mr Mulato Mekkonen (ETA), Mr Hamdy Ibrahim (GTUESR), Mr Lim Cheng (NUTP).
- 14:30 - 15:00           Presentation of the afternoon workshops

- 15:00 - 18:00 Workshops
4. Diversity, discrimination and career development paths
  5. Research and research funding
  6. Higher education unions and the broader trade union movement

*Saturday 25 September*

- 09:00 - 11:00 Parallel Workshops  
Higher education and research union strategies in EI
- 11:30 - 12:30 Open Mike for prepared statements and resolutions
- 14:30 Plenary session  
  
General report/recommendations for trade union strategies in EI
- 16:00 Closing remarks

## Participants' List

Country	Organisation	Name
Australia	NTEU	ALLPORT, Carolyn McCULLOCH, Grahame
Belgium	ACOD	EECKHOUT, Erika VANDEVELDE, Marc
	CGSP	DIEU, Camille VANDAMME, Eric
Canada	CAUT	GRAHAM, Bill LÉGER, Robert
	CEQ	BEAUREGARD, François GAUCHER, Bernard
	FOPPU	DENIS, Roch HAMALIAN, Arpi
Côte d'Ivoire	SYNARES	KOUDOU, Késsié Raymond NYAMIEN, Messou N'Guessan
Denmark	DM	LUNDBERG, Nils-Georg STAGE, Ingrid VRAA-JENSEN, Jens
Egypt	GTUESR	HAMDI IBRAHIM, Mohammed FAROUC MOHAMED, Abdin
Ethiopia	ETA	MULATU-MEKONNEN, Ato
Finland	FUUP	HELENIUS, Ralf
	FUURT	FANT, Björn KETO, Tellervo
	OAJ	ISOMURSU, Marja-Leena
France	FEN	MARIEN, Gérard
	SNCS-FSU	FOSSEY, Jacques MARTIN-JEZEQUEL, Véronique
	SNES-FSU	BAUNAY, Yves
Germany	GEW	KÖHLER, Gerd REICH, Romin
Hungary	FDsZ	KIS PAPP, Laszlo MAYER, Gyorgy SZABO, Gabor
	SEH	BORBATH, Gabor
	TDDSZ	SZECSENYI, Tibor
Ireland	IFUT	GIBBONS, Hugh KILLEAVY, Maureen Ó CEALLAIGH, Daltún WALL, Eugene
Malaysia	NUTP	LIM CHENG, Uo
Mexico	SNTE	MÉNDEZ CHAPARRO, Carlos Arturo SEGURA DORANTES, Carlos
Netherlands	AOb	KNOOP, Martin
New Zealand	AUS	CROZIER, Rob KELSEY, Jane
Norway	NARW	ESKELAND, Trond



		KJENNDALLEN, Kari LEM, Sigrid
Poland	NSZZ Solidarnosc	MOSAKOWSKI, Ryszard SOBIESZCZANSKI, Janusz WITKOWSKA, Hanna
Portugal	FENPROF	CARVALHO, Mario CUNHA SERRA, João PEREIRA DOS SANTOS, Manuel RILO, Nuno
Russia	ESEUR	KOLOBASHKIN, Nikolai PAVLIKHIN, Vladimir
Slovenia	ESWUS	STERGAR, Janez
South Africa	SADTU	ABRAHAMS, Glenn
Spain	F.E.CC.OO.	ESPADAS GARCÍA, Francisco GONZALEZ LÓPEZ, Pedro
	FETE-UGT	MUÑOS RODRÍGUEZ, Teresa RODRÍGUEZ ALVARIÑO, Mario
Sweden	SULF	FREDRIKSSON, Bert JACOBSSON, Calle
United Kingdom	AUT	CARR, Alan EVERETT, Brian
	NATFHE	BENNETT, Paul JOHN, Alan
USA	AAUP	GELLMAN, Estelle RICHARDSON, James SHAW, Patrick
	AFT	McDONALD, John ROBINSON, Perry SCHEUERMAN, William STOLLAR, Louis SWENSON, Norman
	NEA	CAMPBELL JACKSON, Deborah EIDE, Joanne HAYASAKA, Sinikka MAITLAND, Christine SHADWICK, Ann STEARNS, Barry

**Speakers/Guests**

KISS, Adam - *Hungarian State Secretary*

SEDDOH, Komlavi - *UNESCO, Director of the Higher education Division*

CHEVAILLIER, Thierry - *Researcher at IREDU, Dijon (France)*

**El Brussels**

VAN LEEUWEN, Fred - *General Secretary*

FOUILHOUX, Monique - *Education Coordinator*

HANEKROOT, Marianne - *Professional Assistant*

GRISEWOOD, Nick - *Consultant*

## Annex 1

### Speech by Fred van LEEUWEN General Secretary of Education International

Ladies and Gentlemen, Dear Colleagues,

I would like first of all to follow my two Hungarian colleagues who have already addressed this audience and wish you a very warm welcome to Budapest. This International Conference on Higher Education and Research, the second such conference organised by Education International, is the result of a decision taken during our last Congress in Washington within the framework of the adoption of our Work Programme and Budget, a document which specifically mentions that a Conference on questions of concern and interest to this particular sector should be organised every two years.

Dear Colleagues, since its creation in 1993, Education International has believed that it is essential for it to be active, present, visible and recognised as a determining force in this sector at the international level.

We played a large part in the discussions and work which led to the adoption, by the UNESCO General Conference on 11 November 1997, of the "Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel" and we are actively monitoring its application, particularly with regard to the respect of academic freedom. But I will say no more on this subject, as Komlavi Seddoh, Director of the Higher Education Division of UNESCO, who I welcome and thank for having accepted to participate in the work of this conference, will address this subject in greater depth later on.

We held the first El Conference on Higher Education in March 1997 at the UNESCO headquarters in Paris. This conference, which was in some way El's contribution to UNESCO's World Conference, was a success. A certain number of recommendations were elaborated, recommendations which I think have been by and large taken into consideration.

UNESCO's World Conference on Higher Education, held a year ago, saw a high level of representation from El and its member organisations. Together, we were able to act and intervene at all levels, and we were also able to contribute to the drafting of the final texts through our involvement in the Conference's Drafting Committee, which constituted a first for us. We will also be involved in the work of the Conference's Follow-up Committee.

We have also taken part in the recent World Conference on Science, which was held in Budapest. With your help, we were able to find ourselves in the position of making a remarkable contribution, to express our point of view in plenary sessions (only 4 NGOs were invited to speak) and at this Conference as well, we were members of the Drafting Committee, through the involvement of Monique Fouilhoux who attended in her role as President of the Conference of NGOs operating official relations with UNESCO.

Dear Colleagues, I was saying that it was essential for EI to be active. Why? In the first instance, because on the eve of the 21<sup>st</sup> century, we firmly believe that higher education has a crucial role to play in the scientific, technological, economic, social and cultural development of every country, but that it also has an irreplaceable role to play in the evolution of education systems and the training of teachers.

In the second instance, because Education International represents a ever-increasing number of higher education and research personnel. Indeed, at this time there are approximately 850,000 teachers, researchers and education personnel working in higher education institutions and who are members of 78 of Education International's member organisations.

Allow me for a moment to welcome a certain number of member organisations which have joined us since the Washington Congress:

- Canadian Association of University Teachers (CAUT)
- Finnish Union of University Professors (FUUP)
- Association of University Staff of New Zealand (AUS)
- American Association of University Professors (AAUP)

I am sure that your dynamism and in-depth knowledge of the issues facing higher education will be of great value to our work within EI. I would now like to invite the representatives of these four organisations to stand up so that everyone can see you.

Dear Colleagues, our last Congress adopted a resolution. This resolution places particular emphasis on the roles which I have just outlined, but it also stresses that higher education is often an important focus of resistance to authoritarian regimes, and plays a significant role in promoting human rights, democracy and cultural and intellectual tolerance.

In addition, this resolution underlines that the development of higher education and research should be guided by a certain number of principles and priorities of which I shall highlight some aspects:

- Access to higher education should be available to all that meet relevant entry criteria and should not be limited by the financial means or social origins of potential students. This means that higher education, as well as all other education sectors, should be free of fees and charges.
- Funding for universities, colleges and research institutions is primarily the responsibility of the State and public authorities. In discharging this responsibility, the State should give priority to the funding of public institutions.
- While the State has a right and an obligation to insist on public accountability from higher education and research institutions for the expenditure of public funds such accountability should not undermine institutional autonomy in relation to academic policies, curriculum, staff appointments and internal management. Institutional autonomy, in these spheres, is a precondition for the existence of academic freedom. This in turn guarantees that independent research, teaching and scholarship can flourish. And finally,

- An essential element of academic freedom is the right of staff to be directly represented on all key decision-making bodies within universities, colleges and research institutions and for decision-making to reflect collegial principles. Collective decision-making must guarantee and develop individual staff rights such as the freedom to determine teaching style or the right to intellectual property.

The Congress considered in the first instance that:

- The work achieved in the last few years should be continued with a particular focus on the increasingly international nature of higher education, the growing trend toward mass provision of higher education, the world-wide financial crisis in higher education (particularly in the developing world), and the threats to the academic freedom and working conditions of higher education and research staff. And secondly,
- That an expansion in EI activities should aim towards a certain number of objectives, of which I shall only name a few:
  - Strengthen EI's membership base in the higher education and research sector, and build networks in the sector globally and regionally.
  - Achieve and promote the adoption and implementation by national governments of the UNESCO Recommendation Concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel, and develop an effective monitoring process for its implementation.
  - Defend higher education budgets from domestic and international threats in the context of a broader international defence of all education sectors. Opposition to international institutions' attempts to deregulate and privatise education is a central element of this defence.
  - Support academic freedom and the right to collective bargaining including the protection of intellectual property rights and the defence of contract and part-time staff.
  - Promote open and accountable institutional governance and management systems and the appropriate involvement of staff unions. And, last but not least,
  - Strengthen the input of developing countries into the higher education and research work of EI including its regional structures.

Dear Colleagues, this conference today should provide the opportunity for, on the one hand, an in-depth analysis of a certain number of challenges with which higher education is confronted, and on the other hand, the development of EI policies on the basis of those recommendations which I'm sure this conference will produce.

This conference is your conference. It will be what you to decide to make of it, and we will consider your demands and recommendations with all the attention and commitment that they deserve. All the themes under discussion here represent areas of concern, to greater or lesser degrees, for all national higher education systems.

Whether they be themes such as information technologies/distance learning/transnational suppliers. These are important themes in this time of globalisation, and in light of planned discussions within the WTO or initiatives such as

GATE. Diversity, discrimination and career paths, are issues of equal importance as are issues affecting academic freedom, working conditions and collective bargaining.

All these are themes that will be discussed in forthcoming workshops. In my eyes, an equally important theme, which will be discussed in plenary session, is that of "Challenges facing developing countries and those in transition". A theme where I have no doubt the experience of Mr. Seddoh, both as a university professor and ex-Minister of Education for Togo, will be extremely useful to us, as we must widen our field of thought and strengthen our activities aimed towards higher education personnel and their organisations in developing countries.

The degree of importance attached to these questions varies, naturally, from one country to another. However, we must also recognise that higher education and research systems are international by their very nature and that, increasingly, ideas and practices are being exchanged between countries and regions.

In conclusion, I would simply like to draw your attention to the decision taken by our last Congress whereby EI would organised a global campaign for "Quality Public Education for All". We are currently working on a draft campaign plan which will be discussed by our regional representatives in mid-October. Higher education, which is particularly affected by threats from many sources, notably the WTO, must feature in this plan, and I invite you to submit your proposals to us. Furthermore, an EI delegation will be taking part in the negotiations scheduled to take place in Seattle at the end of the year. This delegation will notably include a higher education representative, namely Norman Swenson, Vice-President of the AFT.

Dear Colleagues, at this time, I would like to make two comments. EI must provide a forum for debate but should not become a simple discussion club: our mission must, above all, be one of action. I also hope that we can agree that higher education should not be solely focused on itself, but also has a role to play in other sectors and that we should rise above the barriers which have been built between the different levels of education.

It is for this reason that we implemented a number of structural changes in Washington and why we will continue to do so. As you will certainly know, the Washington Congress adopted a resolution aimed at a revision of EI structures. A letter was sent to all member organisations in June of this year, which was accompanied by a draft proposal. Member organisations have been asked to submit their comments by the 28<sup>th</sup> February next year. I would therefore ask you to make enquiries as to the current state of discussion on this subject within your organisations.

Let this conference therefore be a success, leading to a strengthening of our visibility and our capacity to act collectively. I am also therefore calling upon you to help us recruit the wide range of existing organisations in the higher education and research sector as members, thereby enabling EI to accomplish its trade union mission throughout the world.

## Annex 2 Recommendation concerning the WTO Millennium Round

In accordance with the aims, principles and policies of EI, the delegates to the 1999 Budapest EI International Conference on Higher Education and Research wish to advise the EI General Secretary and Executive Board of serious concerns related to the impending commencement of the WTO Millennium Round. Delegates are concerned that proposals from many OECD countries call for a significant increase in the scope of, and degree of liberalisation achieved by, the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS). This liberalisation would include every possible means of supplying a service, including education. This meeting commends EI for its circular to affiliates on Education and the WTO Millennium Round and urges EI to consider the following:

1. The premise of EI's response to the WTO and of its information programme for EI affiliates should be that the free market model which underpins these liberalisation efforts is inappropriate for tertiary education and education generally.
2. EI's central objective should be to have education excluded from the scope of the GATS.
3. EI should collect information from its affiliates on the consequences of the GATS to date, and encourage affiliates to develop co-ordinated campaigns on the forthcoming negotiations and to establish links with campaigns by non-governmental organisations concerned about the direction of WTO.
4. EI should demand full openness and transparency of negotiations on trade in services: publication of government mandates, consultation with national unions, publication of reports and projects discussed within the OECD.
5. In order to limit the scope for further extension of the GATS coverage of education services, EI should press for:
  - (a) A moratorium on further liberalisation of trade in education services.
  - (b) Retention of the GATS as a bottom-up agreement where countries nominate sectors and sub-sectors for inclusion rather than have to rely upon exemptions from a comprehensive top-down agreement.
  - (c) Full participation by national education unions in the determination of their countries' position.
  - (d) No extension of the GATS to include public education institutions or government subsidies to education providers.
  - (e) Recognition of the right of national governments to regulate the supply of tertiary education services, such as the number of places in particular

discipline areas and the number of corresponding schools or faculties viability is a consideration.

- (f) Recognition of the right of national governments to specify culturally appropriate content for particular courses and qualifications, e.g. knowledge of indigenous culture.
  - (g) Recognition that action taken by governments for the provision of public tertiary education cannot be considered a disguised restriction on trade in services.
  - (h) Rejection of moves to extend liberalisation of government procurement as it applies to tertiary education in GATS or otherwise in the WTO.
6. El should encourage affiliates to issue press statements in their own countries in the two or three weeks leading up to the Seattle talks.

## Annex 3

### Recommendation concerning the implementation of Article 75 of the Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel

Pursuant to the aims and principles of EI, the delegates to the 1999 Budapest EI International Conference on Higher Education and Research request the Officers, the Executive Board and the General Secretary of EI to call upon the Director General of UNESCO to implement immediately Article 75 of the UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel.

Article 75 states:

“... the Director General will prepare a comprehensive report on the world situation with regard to academic freedom and to respect for the human rights of higher-education teaching personnel on the basis of the information supplied by Member States and of any other information supported by reliable evidence which he/she may have gathered by such methods as he/she may deem appropriate.”

We ask EI to call upon the UNESCO Director General to:

1. Publish the reports on academic freedom received from Member States; name the countries that have not provided reports on academic freedom in the context of Article 75; set a new date for the receipt of reports; and, allow for the provision of reports by NGOs.
2. Establish a Commission charged with the responsibility of assembling, analysing and reporting upon the conditions identified in Article 75.
3. In consultation with EI, appoint to the commission a majority of individuals who are “higher education personnel” as defined by Article 1 (f) of the Recommendation<sup>2</sup>.
4. Provide the Commission with the human and financial resources necessary to complete its work within the 24-month period immediately following its creation.

Finally, we urge EI to utilise the budget line established for purposes of monitoring implementation of the Recommendation by assisting affiliates in the collection of relevant data at the national level. Furthermore, we request that a report on the implementation of Article 75 and EI’s work, including data collected, be presented to the Third World Congress of EI in 2001.

---

<sup>2</sup> Article 1(f) of the Recommendation states that “Higher education teaching personnel” means all those persons in institutions or programmes of higher education who are engaged to teach and/or to undertake scholarship and/or to undertake research and/or to provide educational services to students or the community at large.



## Annex 4

### Recommendation concerning the commercialisation of higher education and public sector research

Pursuant to the aims and principles of EI, the delegates to the 1999 Budapest EI International Conference on Higher Education and Research request the Officers, the Executive Board and the General Secretary of EI to endorse the principle that publicly funded higher education and public sector research serve the greater social good, the academic freedom of research personnel and the public interest, and to oppose proposals which make commercialisation a fundamental mission of higher education in addition to teaching, research and service to the community.

Furthermore, we urge EI to take whatever steps are necessary to monitor, resist and publicise the impact of the growing commercialisation of higher education and public sector research including, but not limited to, the strategies of governments which may require researchers to enter into relationships and partnerships with private sector corporations as a condition of public sector research funding; and attempts to vest the ownership of intellectual property produced by publicly funded higher education and public sector research personnel with private sector corporations without regard for the public good and the contractually guaranteed rights and academic freedom rights of researchers.

## Annex 5 Recommendation on East Timor

This El Higher Education and Research Conference requests the El General Secretary and Executive Board to urgently consider the following statement and recommended action on the situation in East Timor, noting that the crisis has resulted in the effective destruction of the University of Dili.

1. El welcomes the decision of the Indonesian government to hold a plebiscite on the future status of East Timor. The overwhelming vote in favour of independence in this plebiscite underlines the illegitimacy of the Indonesian occupation and demonstrates the desire of the East Timorese people for genuine self-determination and freedom.
2. El condemns the wanton violence and terrorism practised by Indonesian army-backed militia gangs in the aftermath of the independence vote, noting that large numbers of people have been killed and that upwards of 100,000 people have been forced to flee their homes. The militia violence has created this wave of refugees, many of whom are being forcibly relocated to Indonesia's province of West Timor.
3. El notes that this humanitarian catastrophe has been accompanied by the virtual razing of the capital, Dili, with an associated destruction of basic infrastructure and services, including schools and the country's only university.
4. In light of the above, El welcomes the decision of the UN to send armed peacekeepers (with reluctant Indonesian government support) to East Timor. Such an armed presence is necessary for the protection of the population. El notes that while the Australian government has assumed a leadership role this has come only after 25 years of Australian complicity in, and recognition of, Indonesia's illegal occupation.
5. In the light of the foregoing, El calls upon the Indonesian Parliament to recognise and accept the outcome of the independence vote as soon as possible, and calls upon the Indonesian army to withdraw in an orderly fashion.
6. El should write to the Secretary General of the UN, the Indonesian President and the Australian and Portuguese Foreign Ministers, conveying the terms of this statement and specifically calling for:
  - humanitarian aid and assistance to refugees, and a programme of orderly return of the displaced to their homes;
  - the establishment of an international reconstruction and development fund for East Timor.
7. El should publicise its position widely amongst affiliates and should co-ordinate an appeal for material and human assistance in the redevelopment of schools and the University of Dili. This should include a request to El affiliates and to national governments for scholarships and other funds to

assist East Timorese students to complete vocational training and university study abroad, pending the redevelopment of the university and schools.

## Annex 6 Recommendation on the situation in Ethiopia

Noting the discussions which have taken place between conference participants regarding the threats facing inter-union solidarity within higher education within the framework of EI,

Alarmed at the news regarding the repression of trade union, institutional and academic freedoms within higher education in Ethiopia,

The EI International Conference on Higher Education and Research, held in Budapest from 23 to 25 September 1999:

- A) Calls upon the Ethiopian government:
1. To free the President of the Ethiopian Teachers' Association (ETA), Dr Taye Woldesmiate, imprisoned for his trade union activities;
  2. To allow and guarantee the ETA to exercise its right to freedom of association in light of its contribution to the improvement of education in Ethiopia;
  3. To implement the recommendations and resolutions passed by the ILO Committee of Experts on Freedom of Association;
  4. To implement the terms of the 1997 UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel, particularly those related to academic freedom and freedom of expression, as well as the terms of the 1966 ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers;
- B) Calls upon EI, in association with its member unions, to intensify its actions and work with international organisations and the governments of our respective countries for an end to the repression of freedoms within the higher education sector in Ethiopia;
- C) Calls upon UNESCO and its Higher Education Division to undertake all necessary steps and take all necessary measures to ensure that all freedoms within the higher education sector in Ethiopia are guaranteed, in accordance with the call made by the UNESCO World Conference on Higher Education to all member states and in accordance with the terms of the International Recommendation on the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel, adopted by the UNESCO General Conference in 1997;
- D) Expresses the support of all EI's member organisations in higher education to the Director of UNESCO's Higher Education Division in all his efforts and initiatives;
- E) Calls on EI to provide its member organisations with up-dated information regarding the current situation in Ethiopia and to supply reports on the future evolution of the situation in order to assist in the further development of their actions of solidarity.