CONSULTATION DOCUMENT OF THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY GROUP (TAG) ON THE EDUCATION INDICATORS

The purpose of this consultation document is to provide an effective basis for Member States to contribute their feedback on the TAG's proposed SDG education indicators (see the attached document).

I. Background

Progress towards the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development[1] will be reviewed and monitored through a limited set of global indicators, for each of the 17 sustainable development goals (SDGs). The United Nations Statistical Commission (UNSC) will provide the necessary statistical support for the elaboration of the global indicator framework to be endorsed at the forty-seventh session of the UNSC in March 2016.

The UNSC has established an Inter-agency and Expert Group on SDG Indicators (IAEG-SDGs), which consists of 28 regionally-representative national statistical offices and, as observers, other Member States and the regional and international organizations and agencies, to develop a proposal for the global indicator framework for the monitoring of the goals and targets of the 2030 Agenda.

The UNSC has emphasised that the global indicator framework should only contain a limited number of indicators, striking a balance between the number of indicators and policy relevance, taking into account conceptual indicator frameworks that have already been developed. It also recognised that besides global universal indicators there will also be additional indicators for thematic, regional and national monitoring, to be organized in an integrated architecture.

The responsibility for developing thematic indicators, which are globally comparable, falls therefore within the scope of the organizations of the international education community. In March 2014, the Technical Advisory Group (TAG) was established by UNESCO to provide feedback on the proposed post-2015 education targets, develop recommendations for indicators and help guide the establishment of a measurement agenda, thus informing and supporting the work of the Education for All Steering Committee (EFA SC). It also provided technical support on indicators to UNESCO and UNICEF as co-leads for education in the UN Technical Support Team (TST). This included feedback on the proposed post-2015 education targets, recommendations for education indicators and for a measurement agenda that meets the demands of the new education and development frameworks.

The TAG undertook a comprehensive technical exercise that resulted in a document (November 2014) that was the basis for a broad consultation process. This included an online public consultation from 17 November 2014 to 30 January 2015 and direct consultations with stakeholders from Member States, civil society, multi-lateral and bi-lateral agencies and academia. Following the public

---

[1] https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/7891TRANSFORMING%20OUR%20WORLD.pdf

consultation period, the stakeholder responses were made available on the website of the UNESCO Institute for Statistics (UIS).

The TAG proposal (Reference Document of the World Education Forum in May 2015) incorporates a brief synthesis of the comments received during the consultation. It proposes a set of 42 education thematic indicators covering all 7 targets and 3 means of implementation (MOI) targets for SDG 4. The work of the TAG is fully aligned with the IAEG-SDGs.

Drawing on the draft proposal of the TAG, upon request of the co-facilitators of the Post-2015 Intergovernmental Negotiations, UNESCO and UNICEF, as co-leads in the TST for the SDG 4, recommended a subset of thematic indicators for consideration as global indicators. These proposals have been incorporated in the set of global indicators currently being reviewed by the IAEG-SDGs.

The education thematic indicators proposed by the TAG are listed by each target in the attached Annex. These include a sub-set that is recommended for use as global indicators. The table highlights which of these indicators have been proposed by the TST on Goal 4 and subsequently included by the UNSC in the preliminary list for consideration under a global indicator framework for the SDGs.

These thematic indicators are being further developed through a consultative process with Member States and partners before a UNESCO high-level meeting in November 2015 at which the Education 2030 Framework for Action and thematic set of education indicators will be endorsed by Member States. The process and steps for finalisation of the education thematic indicators so that they may be able to support and feed into the final SDG indicator framework that will be endorsed by the UNSC in 2016 are as follows:

o The TAG has been expanded to include statistical experts nominated by Member States. The expanded TAG will provide recommendations to the EFA SC and the education co-leads in the TST. In order to ensure regional balance, experts from several countries represent each region. These representatives will consult more widely with other countries and partners within their region.

o The expanded TAG, under the leadership of UNESCO will set up a process for further work on the thematic indicators. This will include a series of consultations both face-to-face and virtually to get further feedback on the indicators and for further development as needed. Two expert meetings will be convened between July and September 2015.

o A set of thematic education indicators will be discussed at an EFA SC meeting in October 2015 and submitted for endorsement together with the Framework for Action at the high-level meeting in November 2015.

o If any changes are made to the global indicators as they are finalised through the process coordinated by the UNSC, the thematic indicators will be subsequently aligned.

II. The first meeting of the extended TAG

The extended TAG met on 30-31 July 2015 at UNESCO in Paris, France to review the TAG proposal for thematic indicators as presented at the World Education Forum in Incheon, Republic of Korea in May, 2015. The agenda and meeting report can be accessed at www.uis.unesco.org.

The extended TAG includes the original members of the Group *plus* representatives from Member States and civil society. The purpose of the meeting was to review the TAG's proposal for 42 thematic indicators to monitor the education targets related to the Sustainable Development Goals, including:

- Assessing each indicator by criteria for relevance, alignment, feasibility and communicability;

- Making the link between the necessity of measuring what is politically relevant; and

- Considering the constraints in some areas to have the best indicators immediately.

The extended TAG generally endorsed the proposals for indicators, but also set out important areas for improvements to the existing proposal, including more detailed discussion of the flexibility of the indicator framework and allowing for temporary placeholders for indicators as new and more comprehensive approaches to measurement are developed. The breadth and depth of the proposed education agenda exceeds present capacity to produce reliable education data for global monitoring. The question then becomes how best to design global monitoring to compensate for the present lack of data while spurring effective monitoring in upcoming years. For example, in learning outcomes, a cross-nationally comparable metric is not currently available for all countries in the world. Should an alternative be explored, such as the UIS Index of Learning Outcomes that would integrate multiple forms of existing data? Could the creation of another measure of institutional or technical characteristics of the assessment systems, such as the presence of an independent planning or assessment unit be used until there is consensus on the appropriate measures?

III. The key consultation questions

Based on the view of the extended TAG meeting participants, the following set of key consultation questions in relation to the indicators in the proposal was identified which are outlined in this document. These questions are designed for facilitated consultation with member states and concerned agencies which will take place from 14 August to 7 September 2015. The consultations will be facilitated by the Regional group representatives included in the extended TAG as well as those of the respective concerned agencies. The extended TAG will receive the feedback on the consultations in the following areas, which are grouped by SDG target. A key aim is to ensure that the proposed indicators are relevant and allow a clear narrative regarding measuring the progress in those areas of education.

Member States are requested to discuss the key consultation questions presented below with their Regional Group representatives. The Regional Group representatives will be responsible for collecting the feedback from the member states in their regions, consolidating this feedback into a regional view and presenting this consolidated feedback to the extended TAG at its next meeting.

Target 4.1 – By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys complete free, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and effective learning outcomes

a.   Which of the following three proposals for developing indicator 1 should be pursued?

a.i.   Leveraging existing resources at the national level to propose initial indicators for monitoring learning outcomes based on national assessments and nationally defined standards.

a.ii   Foster an international collaboration for generating global snapshots using an equating or linking study based on existing cross-national learning assessments, starting with reading and mathematics

a.iii   Explore the feasibility of advancing the creation of a universal learning scale

b.   If a.ii is chosen, should national assessments be included in the proposed equating/linking study?

c.   Should an indicator be included on the distribution of learning outcomes by sex, by location and by SES, in addition to the percentage reaching minimum levels of proficiency?

d. Should early grades (grades 2 or 3) be included as an additional point for measurement of learning outcomes?

e. Should there be current and retrospective measures of completion by level of education and are the indicators proposed (indicators 3 and 4, respectively) the best options to do that?

f. To what extent can indicator 6 be reported on accurately from existing datasets and is it policy-relevant?

Additional comments on the indicator proposal for this target:

Target 4.2 – By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys have access to quality early childhood development, care and pre-primary education so that they are ready for primary education

a. What factors should be considered when deciding on a measurement approach to measure child development/learning at the start of school? Is the ECDI the most appropriate basis for the development of indicator 8? What other international or national instruments should also be considered?

b. How should measurement of learning at the end of pre-primary or the start of primary school be linked with measurement of learning for Target 4.1?

c. How should the access to education of very young children (from 2 years to age of starting primary education) be monitored, considering the differences existing between countries in terms of their policies and national priorities for those groups? Are the indicators 10 and 11 the best options to monitor the access to those types of programmes? How should informal, private and community-based providers be included in monitoring of access?

Additional comments on the indicator proposal for this target:

Target 4. 3 – By 2030, ensure equal access for all women and men to affordable and quality technical, vocational and tertiary education, including university

a. Should the indicators proposed under this target prioritize the equality dimension over the universal access dimension?

Additional comments on the indicator proposal for this target:

Target 4.4 – By 2030, substantially increase the number of youth and adults who have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship

a. Are there other indicators than ICT skills for measuring the concept of skills for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship intended in Target 4.4? If so what, other indicators should be considered?

Additional comments on the indicator proposal for this target:

Target 4.5 – By 2030, eliminate gender disparities in education and ensure equal access to all levels of education and vocational training for the vulnerable, including persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples and children in vulnerable situations

a. Should the indicator text specifically name disadvantaged groups in indicators as per target (e.g., persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples and children in vulnerable situations, etc.)

b. Is the proposed indicator 19 satisfactory as a measure of inequality of educational policies implemented in countries; if not then does another indicator meet the criteria?

Additional comments on the indicator proposal for this target:

Target 4.6 – By 2030, ensure that all youth and a substantial proportion of adults, both men and women, achieve literacy and numeracy

a. Is the proposed indicator 24 easily understood and allow a clear narrative regarding measuring the progress in the participation of the adult population in literacy programmes; if not, then does another indicator meet the criteria

Additional comments on the indicator proposal for this target:

Target 4.7 – By 2030, ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development

a. Are indicators 25 and 26 satisfactory as general placeholders, leaving specifications for the future on the basis of further development work being carried out by UNESCO, UNICEF, IEA and OECD on measures of global citizenship and education for sustainable development? If not, please suggest alternatives

b. Should an indicator that measures country effort, such as curriculum coverage of global citizenship and sustainable development, be included?

Additional comments on the indicator proposal for this target:

Means of implementation 4.a-4.c

4.a Build and upgrade education facilities that are child, disability and gender sensitive and provide safe, non-violent, inclusive and effective learning environments for all

4.b By 2020, substantially expand globally the number of scholarships available to developing countries, in particular least developed countries, small island developing States and African countries, for enrolment in higher education, including vocational training and information and communications technology, technical, engineering and scientific programmes, in developed countries and other developing countries

4.c By 2030, substantially increase the supply of qualified teachers, including through international cooperation for teacher training in developing countries, especially least developed countries and small island developing States

a. Should there be an indicator that captures the key concept in the target - teacher force needs/shortages and what should it look like? Should indicators on class size or pupil teacher ratios be added to better capture the deployment of teachers?

b. Should the document designate key dimensions and map national minimum quality standards and data availability for indicators related to school environments and facilities?

c. Should indicator related to 4.b include national scholarships in addition to scholarships from other countries?

d. Are there other indicators than indicators 38 and 39 that serve as a proxy of quality of teachers?

e. Is there a more appropriate indicator for measuring teacher motivation than teacher salaries?

Additional comments on the indicator proposal for this target:

Table 1. Proposed thematic indicator framework

Goal: Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all

1 Concept	2 No.	3 Indicator	4 Equity	5 Sex	6 Location	7 Wealth	8 Available	9 Coverage	10 Recommended by *	11 Comments
Targets 4.1-4.7										
4.1 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys complete free, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and effective learning outcomes										
Learning	1.	Percentage of children who achieve minimum proficiency standards in reading/mathematics at end of: (i) primary and (ii) lower secondary school	Yes	X	X	X	3-5 years		TST UNSC	The indicator requires the development of a global metric for each subject as a reference point to which different assessments (national, regional and international) can be anchored. Assessments at other levels (e.g. Grade 2) could be considered.
	2.	Percentage of countries that have organized a nationally-representative learning assessment at the end of (i) primary and (ii) lower secondary school during the last 3 years	No				1-3 years			Standards will need to be developed.
Completion	3.	Gross intake ratio to the last grade (primary, lower secondary)	Yes	X			Yes	c150	TST	
	4.	Completion rate (primary, lower secondary, upper secondary)	Yes	X	X	X	Yes	c100	TST UNSC	This indicator is currently available but work is required to finalise a common methodology and increase the number of surveys available to calculate it.
Participation	5.	Out-of-school rate (primary, lower secondary)	Yes	X			Yes	c160	TST	This indicator will also be used to monitor children and adolescents in refugee and displaced populations in line with efforts to improve coverage.
	6.	Percentage of children over-age for grade (primary, lower secondary)	Yes	X	X	X	Yes	c100		This indicator is currently available but some work is required for a methodology on age adjustment
Provision	7.	Number of years of (i) free and (ii) compulsory primary and secondary education guaranteed in legal frameworks	No				Yes	All		

4.2 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys have access to quality early childhood development, care and pre-primary education so that they are ready for primary education

Category	#	Indicator								Notes
Readiness	8.	Percentage of children under 5 years of age who are developmentally on track in health, learning and psychosocial well-being	Yes	X	X	X	3-5 years		TST UNSC	This indicator is currently tracked via the Early Childhood Development Index available from MICS but work is needed over the next 3-5 years to examine other alternatives, reach consensus and develop a set of questions for use across surveys.
	9.	Percentage of children under 5 years of age experiencing responsive and stimulating parenting	Yes	X	X	X	Yes	c30		This indicator is currently available through MICS but work is needed over the next 3-5 years to examine other alternatives, reach consensus and develop a set of questions for use across surveys.
Participation	10.	Participation rate in organized learning (from 24 months to official primary school entry age)	Yes	X	X	X	3-5 years		TST UNSC	It is necessary to harmonise this indicator across surveys in two areas: (i) age group of reference (e.g. MICS asks question about 3- to 4-year-olds) and (ii) description of programmes (e.g. many surveys may not capture the concept of organized learning).
	11.	Gross pre-primary enrolment ratio	Yes	X			Yes	c165		
Provision	12.	Number of years of (i) free and (ii) compulsory pre-primary education guaranteed in legal frameworks	No				Yes	All		

4.3 By 2030, ensure equal access for all women and men to affordable and quality technical, vocational and tertiary education, including university

Category	#	Indicator								Notes
Participation	13.	Gross enrolment ratio for tertiary education	Yes	X			Yes	c145	TST UNSC	
	14.	Participation rate in technical-vocational education programmes (15- to 24-year-olds)	Yes	X			3-5 years		TST UNSC	Currently data are available on technical-vocational enrolment in upper secondary, post-secondary non-tertiary and short-cycle tertiary education. There are difficulties in collecting data by age and TVET in settings other than formal schools/universities.
	15.	Participation rate of adults in formal and non-formal education and training	Yes	X	X	X	Yes	c30	TST UNSC	Currently data are only available on adult education in European Union countries. Considerable work is required to develop a set of questions to be applied in labour force or other surveys globally.

4.4 By 2030, substantially increase the number of youth and adults who have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship

Category	#	Indicator								Notes
Skills	16.	Percentage of youth/adults with ICT skills by type of skills	Yes	X	X	X	1-3 years	...	TST UNSC	Few surveys (e.g. ICILS) attempt to measure such skills. Major efforts are required to develop global data collection.

4.5 By 2030, eliminate gender disparities in education and ensure equal access to all levels of education and vocational training for the vulnerable, including persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples and children in vulnerable situations

Equity cross-targets	…	We recommend the parity index (female/male, rural/ urban, bottom/top wealth quintile] for all indicators on this list that can be disaggregated (as identified in Column 5)							TST UNSC	Alternative ideas instead of the parity index may be: (i) odds ratio; (ii) concentration index; or (iii) least advantaged group (e.g. poorest rural girls) relative to the mean. In addition, education indicators for people with disabilities will be monitored in line with efforts to improve coverage.
Policy	17.	Percentage of students in primary education whose mother tongue is the language of instruction	Yes	X	X	X	3-5 years			Major efforts will be required to develop a global measurement tool.
	18.	Percentage of countries which have an explicit formula-based policy reallocating education resources to disadvantaged populations	No				3-5 years			A reporting process is required for countries to describe their policies and a methodology will need to be developed to assess these policies.
	19.	Percentage of total education expenditure borne by households	No				Yes	c35		Currently data are only available for more developed countries. Considerable work is needed to develop national education accounts in less developed countries.
	20.	Percentage of total aid to education allocated to low-income countries	No				Yes	c60		

4.6 By 2030, ensure that all youth and a substantial proportion of adults, both men and women, achieve literacy and numeracy

Skills	21.	Percentage of youth/adults proficient in literacy skills	Yes	X	X	X	3-5 years		TST UNSC	While a number of middle-income (STEP) and high-income (PIAAC) countries have assessed literacy skills of adults, a cost-effective tool needs to be inserted in other surveys for use across countries.
	22.	Percentage of youth/adults proficient in numeracy skills	Yes	X	X	X	3-5 years			While some middle-income (STEP) and high-income (PIAAC) countries have assessed adult numeracy skills, a cost-effective tool is needed to be integrated in other surveys for use across countries.
	23.	Youth / adult literacy rate	Yes	X			Yes	c160	TST UNSC	

Provision	24.	Participation rate of illiterate adults in literacy programmes	Yes	X	X	X	3-5 years			Currently data are only available on adult education in European Union countries. Tools should be developed in conjunction with indicator 15.

4.7 By 2030, ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development

Knowledge	25.	Percentage of 15-year-old students showing proficiency in knowledge of environmental science and geoscience	Yes	X	X	X	Yes	c55	TST UNSC	Only one survey (PISA 2006) attempts to measure such knowledge. Major efforts will be required to develop a global measurement tool.
Attitudes	26.	Percentage of 13-year-old students endorsing values and attitudes promoting equality, trust and participation in governance	Yes	X	X	X	Yes	c40	TST UNSC	Only one survey (ICCS 2009) attempts to measure such attitudes. Major efforts will be required to develop a global measurement tool.
Participation	27.	Percentage of teaching hours dedicated to education for sustainable development/global citizenship education	No				3-5 years			Major preparatory work is required to develop a consensus on what elements of curricula across countries correspond to these concepts.
	28.	Percentage of schools that provide life skills-based HIV and sexuality education	No				3-5 years			An overhaul of the way countries report on this indicator will be required to ensure estimates are better linked to the reality at the school level.
	29.	Countries implementing the framework on the World Programme on Human Rights Education (as per UNGA resolution 59/113)	No				Yes	All		

Means of implementation 4.a-4.c

4.a Build and upgrade education facilities that are child, disability and gender sensitive and provide safe, non-violent, inclusive and effective learning environments for all

Resources	30.	Percentage of schools providing (i) basic drinking water; (ii) adequate sanitation; and (iii) adequate hygiene services	Yes		X		1-3 years		TST UNSC	Considerable work is required to extend the coverage of current data collection efforts to all countries.
	31.	Pupil-to-computer ratio by level	Yes		X		Yes	c60		
	32.	Percentage of schools with (i) electricity and (ii) Internet access for pedagogical purposes	Yes		X		Yes	c70		
	33.	Percentage of schools with adapted infrastructure and materials for people with disabilities	Yes		X		3-5 years			Major preparatory work is required to develop an approach on assessing school conditions for people with disabilities across countries.
Environment	34.	Percentage of students experiencing	Yes	X	X	X	Yes	80		The indicator is available through the Global School-based

		bullying, corporal punish-ment, harassment, violence, sexual discrimination and abuse							Student Health Survey. See http://www.who.int/chp/gshs/datasets/en/
	35.	Number of attacks on students, personnel and institutions	No				3-5 years			Considerable work is needed to establish an organized data collection to measure this target.

4.b By 2020, substantially expand globally the number of scholarships available to developing countries, in particular least developed countries, small island developing States and African countries, for enrolment in higher education, including vocational training and information and communications technology, technical, engineering and scientific programmes, in developed countries and other developing countries

Number	36.	Number of higher education scholarships awarded by beneficiary country	No				1-3 years			Considerable work is needed to establish an organized data collection to measure this target.
	37.	Volume of official development assistance (ODA) flows for higher education scholarships by beneficiary country	No				Yes	All	TST UNSC	This indicator only measures some sources of scholarships.

4.c By 2030, substantially increase the supply of qualified teachers, including through international cooperation for teacher training in developing countries, especially least developed countries and small island developing States

Qualified	38.	Percentage of teachers qualified according to national standards (by level)	No				1-3 years		TST	Following preparatory work, countries will begin reporting on this indicator for the first time from the academic year 2014 onwards.
Trained	39.	Percentage of teachers trained according to national standards (by level)	No				Yes		TST UNSC	Major efforts will be required to agree on common standards.
Motivated	40.	Average teacher salary relative to other professionals	No				1-3 years			Major efforts will be required to develop a methodology based on labour force data.
	41.	Teacher attrition rate	No				1-3 years			Considerable work is required to extend the coverage of current data collections to all countries.
Supported	42.	Percentage of teachers receiving in-service training	No				3-5 years			Major efforts will be required to develop a tool that assesses the incidence, duration and content of training.

Note: Column 10 specifies the indicators that were proposed by the UN Technical Support Team (TST) for Goal 4 (Education) of which a subset was included in the preliminary list of the UN Statistical Commission (UNSC) in March 2015.