

# Education International Report

to The Expert Committee on the Application of the

**1966 ILO/UNESCO RECOMMENDATION  
ON THE STATUS OF TEACHERS**

and

**1997 UNESCO RECOMMENDATION ON  
THE STATUS OF HIGHER EDUCATION  
TEACHING PERSONNEL**



Education International  
Internationale de l'Éducation  
Internacional de la Educación

## FOREWORD

Forty years have passed since the adoption of the 1966 ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers. Almost a decade has gone by since governments in 1997 made further commitments to quality education provision by adopting the UNESCO Recommendation on the status of Higher Education Personnel.

Education International (EI) has been invited to present a document to the triennial meeting of CEART (The Expert Committee on the Application of the ILO/UNESCO “Recommendation on the Status of Teachers” and the “Recommendation on the Status of Higher-Education Teaching Personnel”).

This report by EI to CEART intends to overview the progress and shed some light on the following issues from the perspective of education personnel represented by teachers’ unions worldwide. In its contribution EI focuses on eight issues:

- **Teacher shortage and the recruitment of unqualified teachers;**
- **Teacher salaries;**
- **Consultations with teacher organisations;**
- **Academic freedom and tenure for teachers ;**
- **Collegiate governance;**
- **Safe school environment and violence against teachers;**
- **Private schools and institutions; and**
- **HIV/AIDS**

The report demonstrates that, in all the major issues addressed, key paragraphs of the Recommendations are not duly fulfilled, or are largely disregarded in the current policies of many governments. The report concludes by identifying general trends and concerns, and points to a number of matters that deserve due consideration.

The findings in this report are based on a variety of sources. These include a number of studies carried out by EI on the various issues referred to in the report; documentation and reports from EI’s last international congress and past conferences; EI resolutions; contributions by EI’s affiliate national teachers’ organisations in reply to a survey undertaken by EI; and other relevant data produced externally.

This report argues that both Recommendations are not adequately implemented. Additionally, new challenges have emerged, perhaps requiring an expansion of the scope of the Recommendations. However, the current provisions are fundamental for maintaining education as a public good, as well as in tackling these emerging issues, and should be properly implemented.



Fred van Leeuwen  
General secretary

# EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Since 1966, the UNESCO/ILO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers has essentially served as a charter of rights for teachers worldwide. It is so significant that October 5, the anniversary of its signing, became the date chosen for World Teachers' Day. Similarly the 1997 Recommendation on the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel made further commitments regarding college and university faculty. Finally, teachers and professors at all levels had international instruments that defined their responsibilities and asserted their rights as professionals and as workers.

In adopting the Recommendations, governments unanimously recognized the fundamental importance to society of having highly-qualified teachers who are equipped to do their best for the next generation. Although governments the world over claim to support the values and principles in the Recommendations, many do not actually demonstrate respect for the rights enshrined in them, nor do they implement policies that comply with them. Therefore, it is critically important that the ILO/UNESCO Committee of Experts (CEART) continues to monitor the application of the Recommendations, and to rule on violations of teachers' rights.

As the global union federation representing teachers and education workers in more than 160 countries, Education International is well placed to report on and evaluate the situation of teachers' rights around the world. Based in Brussels with regional offices in Africa, Latin America, Asia Pacific and North America-Caribbean, EI comprises almost 350 organizations with more than 29 million members.

Over the past 40 years, significant progress has been made in providing quality education to the world's children: sustained reforms of education systems globally and the invention of mass public education in most countries. In many respects, these reforms were guided by the letter and the spirit of the international Recommendations of 1966 and 1997.

As this report shows, the professional lives of some teachers are full and satisfying, while others suffer in school and society. Their experiences are as different as day and night.

In some parts of the world teachers make good salaries and are respected for their professionalism. They can count on reasonable classroom conditions, adequate learning resources and support from governments committed to educating their citizenry. Unfortunately, these are the lucky few.

The vast majority of the world's teachers still strive to do the best for children despite inadequate training, terrible salaries, unmanageable class sizes, shortage of basic supplies, lack of government support for education or even official repression of teachers and their unions.

EI's report to the triennial meeting of the CEART decries the fact that in all the major areas addressed, key elements of the Recommendations are disregarded. The report addresses eight major issues:

## Teacher shortage

There is a major shortage of teachers looming, with increasing numbers set to retire and few newly qualified entrants to the profession. Unfortunately most governments are applying strategies that only serve to undermine quality of education: the intensification of teachers' workload in developed nations and the hiring of unqualified personnel in the developing nations. EI is calling for governments to invest in significant improvements to the living and working conditions of teachers to facilitate greater recruitment and retention in future.

## Teachers' salaries

Teachers' low salaries are at the root of the shortage. The report documents ongoing long-term deterioration in teachers' earning power. EI is calling for adequate pay levels across the teaching force, thus restoring high social prestige to the teaching profession as a long-term guarantee for social cohesion, progress and stability.

### Consultation with teachers' organizations

The two Recommendations clearly call for governments to recognise teachers' unions and representative organizations as partners in policy-making. Unfortunately, nations demonstrate widespread violation of this provision. Without the full cooperation and participation of teaching professionals, no education reform can succeed. EI calls for governments to engage in social dialogue with teachers and their unions to build stronger public education systems.

### Academic freedom and tenure for teachers

Academic freedom and tenure for teachers are crucial to education systems that are free from political, economic, ideological or religious influences.. Recently teachers experience more centralized control over curriculum and pedagogy, along with interference in educational matters by government authorities, the media and the church. Globalisation, commodification and market forces all increase these pressures on free academic inquiry and research.

### Collegiate governance

While collective decision-making is acknowledged to be of utmost importance and faculty participation in governing bodies used to be guaranteed. Today however, academic personnel are excluded from governing bodies of higher educational institutions to an unprecedented degree. EI strongly opposes the trend toward unilateral management of higher education institutions and advocates a return to collegiate governance.

### Safe school environments and violence against teachers

Living and working conditions of teachers are threatened by the growing phenomenon of violence in schools, a reflection of broader shifts in society at large. For teachers to be protected in their workplaces, effective insurance systems must be in place. However, this remains a dream for most teachers. EI advocates ongoing work with parents and communities towards a culture of cooperation and tolerance in schools.

### Private schools and institutions

EI is particularly concerned with the spread of private institutions at the expense of public schools and universities. Education is a public good, and a service to the citizenry. It is not a commodity to be bought and sold, and it should not be privatized for profit. EI calls on the public authorities to shoulder their responsibility to open up access to education for all, not only for the elite few.

### HIV and AIDS

The HIV and AIDS pandemic poses one of history's most significant challenges to the medical and educational communities, and indeed to societies across the globe. The drastic scale of the problem and the lack of capacity to address it is of major concern to teachers, particularly in sub-Saharan Africa. The spread of the pandemic significantly undermines efforts to achieve Education for All, one of the Millennium Development Goals. EI calls for an end to discrimination against HIV-affected professionals, and is concerned about the gender issue, as most people affected worldwide are women.

### Conclusion

Despite the many difficulties facing educators around the world, EI does not want to lose sight of the remarkable progress that has been achieved in public education over the past four decades. The 1966 and 1997 Recommendations are not yet fully implemented; they remain unachieved ideals, but there can be no doubt they are worth striving for. EI believes the Recommendations must be universally implemented because only then will all children have the opportunity to learn, grow and contribute to their fullest potential.

1. Education International (EI) has been invited to present a document to the triennial meeting of CEART (The Expert Committee on the Application of the ILO/UNESCO “Recommendation on the Status of Teachers” and the “Recommendation on the Status of Higher-Education Teaching Personnel”). EI appreciates this opportunity to make such a contribution yet again, and re-affirms its ongoing commitment in promoting and supporting the implementation of the two recommendations.
2. In its contribution to the CEART meeting by way of this report, EI focuses on eight issues:
  - **Teacher shortage and the recruitment of unqualified teachers;**
  - **Teacher salaries;**
  - **Consultations with teacher organisations;**
  - **Academic freedom and tenure for teachers ;**
  - **Collegiate governance;**
  - **Safe school environment and violence against teachers;**
  - **Private schools and institutions; and**
  - **HIV/AIDS**
3. The report ends with a conclusion which identifies general trends and concerns and points to a number of matters that deserve due consideration.
4. The findings in this report are based on a variety of sources. These include a number of studies carried out by EI on the various issues referred to in the report; documentation and reports from EI’s last international congress and past conferences; EI resolutions; contributions by EI’s affiliate national teachers’ organisations in reply to a survey undertaken by EI; and some other relevant data produced externally.

## I. TEACHER SHORTAGE AND THE RECRUITMENT OF UNQUALIFIED TEACHERS

### 1966 ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers

5. Today, teacher shortage represents undoubtedly a major issue in education. On the one side, an increasing number of teachers are retiring and a growing percentage is leaving the profession, while, on the other side, the supply of qualified teachers does not appear to be rising. This leads to a serious difficulty in recruiting qualified teachers, particularly, but not only, in developing countries. As the Report *Teachers and Educational Quality* by UNESCO Institute for Statistics (2006) indicates, due to demographical trends, across all regions more than 76 countries will need to enlarge significantly their teaching forces in order to meet UPE goals. These countries are mostly found in Sub-Saharan Africa, Arab states, South and West Asia; together they will need an additional 2.7 million teachers in the next decade.
6. The ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers recognizes that teacher shortage is a major issue, and draws attention to the fact that this is greatly dependent upon teachers’ living and working conditions:

Authorities should recognize that improvements in the social and economic status of teachers, their living and working conditions, their terms of employment and their career prospects are the best means of overcoming any existing shortage of competent and experienced teachers, and of attracting to and retaining in the teaching profession substantial numbers of fully qualified persons (Para145).

7. The Recommendation advises that teacher shortage should be dealt with by exceptional measures, which do not detract from or endanger in any way professional standards already established or to be established and which minimize educational loss to pupils (Para141(1)). In the developing world, where the problem seems to be particularly acute, the Recommendation encourages the establishment of a fully professional, extensive programme [...] to produce corps of professionally prepared teachers competent to guide and direct the educational enterprises (Para142).

Para 143:“(1) Students admitted to training in short term, emergency programmes should be selected in terms of the standards applying to admission to the normal professional programme, or even higher ones, to ensure that they will be capable of subsequently completing the requirements of the full programme. (2) Arrangements and special facilities, including extra study leave on full pay, should enable such students to complete their qualifications in service”

8. In other words, governments should adopt exceptional temporary measures to cope with situations of severe teacher shortage in the short run, in a way to minimize the negative effects that these measures are likely to have on the quality of education. So far, in Europe and North America, the most common strategies have gone towards an increase in the class size of qualified teachers, or in the number of lessons taught – ‘making the most’ out of those qualified teachers already in school. In Africa, Asia and Latin America, instead, the most common response has been the recruitment of unqualified or not fully qualified teachers (the so-called *para-* or *volunteer* or *community teachers*) (see EI Report to CEART July 2003). All these strategies, however, carry along lasting negative effects on the quality of education. There is, as the Recommendation states, need to solve the problem in the long run, through specific programmes allowing unqualified teachers to get a full professional qualification.
9. Latest reports from numerous member organizations denounce a **persistent** and severe **problem of teacher shortage**, particularly in **Asia, Africa, Latin America and the Caribbean**. In many countries, the lack of supply of qualified professionals for teaching - that in certain cases (Pakistan) can reach a shortage of 30% in primary and secondary school - leads to the recruitment of people who were, in principle, trained for other professions (this is the case in Algeria, for instance). Unqualified teachers are often hired on a temporary basis, or part-time. The shortage seems to particularly affect remote areas, such as rural areas or high risk areas (like *guerrilla*-affected zones in the Philippines or in Sri Lanka, for example), where communities themselves run schools by hiring unqualified teachers in order to provide children with a form of education (Nepal). Malaysia represents a unique counter-example, showing an actual over supply of teachers - on the totality of teachers in the country, 90% are fully qualified teachers, while 10% are either unqualified teachers who are undergoing some form of training, or temporary teachers.
10. In **Europe**, evidence on teacher shortage is discordant. While, in the last years, some Eastern European countries had to confront this problem (Czech Republic and Slovakia, for example), there is no strong evidence on the issue in the majority of Western European countries (Eurydice, 2005). Evidence from the UK, however, would suggest an increase on the total number of teachers by 8% since 1997. This increase could be due to the implementation of the 2003 National Agreement, which has carried along improvements to teachers’ conditions, and, therefore, provided key drivers for ameliorating teacher retention and recruitment. This could be the result, as well, of the increase in the number of school support staff, which has remarkably lightened the non-teaching related working burden of teachers - given that so many teachers identified workload and work/life balance concerns as key priority issues to be addressed in order to improve their job satisfaction. Moreover, the implementation of the New Regulations enacted in 2003 ensured for the first time that employers could not substitute or replace qualified teachers with less well qualified staff. Yet any improvement in teacher recruitment in recent years could be actually seen against the background of substantial teacher shortages in the 1990s and the first years of this decade. In addition, this growth in the number of qualified regular teachers could be mainly due to a large increase in part-time teachers - the

*Latest reports from numerous member organizations denounce a persistent and severe problem of teacher shortage, particularly in Asia, Africa, Latin America and the Caribbean.*

number of full-time qualified regular teachers increased by only 4,900 (1%) between 1997 and 2006, while, during the same period, the number of part-time qualified regular teachers increased by 16,600 (55%). Furthermore, there has been a significant increase in the number of teachers without qualified teacher status (QTS). Evidence suggests, additionally, a problem of teachers' recruitment in certain subjects.

11. **How do governments respond to the problem of teacher shortage?** According to our latest survey, their responses range from exceptional short-term actions to, more rarely, well-developed strategies to tackle the issue in the long term.
12. **In the developing world, temporary reparatory measures – like the recruitment of unqualified personnel – very often become a widespread and persistent practice.** In Mauritius, for example, in many cases head-school teachers, apart from performing administrative duties, have to replace teachers in the classrooms - but no consistent strategy appears to have been set up, so far. In Fiji, where the policy of the Ministry of Education gives the opportunity to exercise the profession only to fully trained teachers, either classes are very big (up to 50-57 pupils per class in primary and secondary schools), particularly in urban areas, or teachers are required, especially in rural areas, to teach to multiple classes (up to 3-5 classes in which the average number of students may vary between 5 and 16).
13. Central America (Honduras, Nicaragua) has seen an increase in the so-called *empirismo*<sup>1</sup>, especially in rural areas, where the extremely bad working and living conditions of the profession oblige teachers to quit or, even, to leave their communities to look for better jobs elsewhere. In Honduras, in particular, the EI regional office in Latin America denounces a worsening of the situation has an effect of the implementation of the PROHECO project (more than 5000 PROHECO<sup>2</sup> schools in the last year), which, by focusing on a participatory management of educational institutes at the level of the community, has often led to the recruitment of unqualified teachers.
14. **Yet some remarkably promising cases exist among developing countries.** In Zimbabwe, where teacher shortage became particularly severe during the 80s, the government adopted a two-fold approach: on the one side, it engaged untrained teachers in massive training programmes; on the other side, it recalled retired qualified teachers to help with the increasing number of teachers in the schools. Training programmes are carried out by the Zimbabwe Integrated Teacher Education Programme (ZINTEC) colleges, and give priority to unqualified teachers; the programme's formative module focuses on practical teacher involvement. Even if some rural areas remain affected by lack of fully trained teachers, evidence suggests a real increase in qualified personnel throughout schools in the country – today, the country has about 5,000 untrained teachers out of 108,000 teachers in service.
15. In conclusion, it seems that, when confronted with teacher shortage, only a few governments are actually able to develop long-term strategies to effectively solve the problem. In most of the cases, they simply adopt short-term reactions to mitigate the gravity of the issue. Anyhow, it is crucial to note that, largely speaking, those long-term strategies that have been undertaken so far by governments have mainly addressed teachers' training, instead of tackling the broader issue of teachers' working conditions. In Estonia, for example, where unqualified teachers are exceptionally employed for 1-year terms, the government has set up a 160-hour pedagogical in-service training for employees with a diploma from higher education but with a different specialization – in other words, through the 'Open Universities' it is possible to acquire a formal qualification while working at the same time.
16. EI is particularly concerned with the issue of teacher shortage, and recommends two lines of action. First, an improvement in the living and working conditions of teachers, in order to make the teaching profession more attractive, and, second, an enhancement of the quality of teachers' education. Particularly, EI believes that, even if the development of various sorts of programmes to train unqualified teachers represents undoubtedly a major step, the improvement of both the living

1. Un-qualified or not fully qualified teachers are called to teach in schools.

2. PROHECO Community Education Program launched by the World Bank in Honduras in 1999 ([www.worldbank.org](http://www.worldbank.org))

standards and the working conditions of teachers should be a key focus for governments if they want to really make the teaching career attractive for young people, while at the same time retaining those qualified teachers who are already in service. Nonetheless, none of the member organizations reports a noticeable tendency in that direction, in spite of a clear identification of the linkage between teachers' bad salaries and alarming working conditions, on the one hand, and teacher shortage and retention, on the other hand.

## 1997 UNESCO Recommendation on the Status of Higher Education Personnel

*In higher education, trends in academic staff salaries, conditions and career patterns point to the bleak conclusion that there has been a steady deterioration for higher education and research staff...*

17. In higher education, trends in academic staff salaries, conditions and career patterns point to the bleak conclusion that there has been a steady deterioration for higher education and research staff, symbolised by the **growth of casualisation and "deprofessionalisation"** of such staff. Paradoxically, this has happened at a time when student enrolments are dramatically increasing and the importance of higher education is widely acknowledged.
18. Linked to this issue is the notion of competition for research funds. This is cause for concern not only for the implications it has for academic freedom, in terms of the conditions imposed by funding bodies regarding the use of research funds and results, but also for the way in which success in obtaining such funds seems to be a determining factor for continued employment in higher education institutions.
19. **Brain Drain** is another great cause for concern. In recent times, increasing globalisation has led to the phenomenon of migration of academics across a wide range of nations – East/West, North/South, developing and developed countries. In particular, Africa has suffered from a depletion of its skilled workforce because of the high rate of emigration, while there has been the 'brain gain' effect in the UK due to the high rate of immigration. This is due to a number of push and pull factors, which result in the movement of academics across the globe. When applied together, these factors result in a considerable force which is exerted on academics in regions such as Africa, but also in Eastern European states and in other parts of the globe.
20. Indeed, African higher education institutions continue to contend with a shortage of academic staff, and, as a consequence, do not seem capable of the intellectual strength needed to drive capacity-building efforts to the continent. Many higher education institutions seem to have difficulties in recruiting staff, while a number of them are losing staff at the same time.

## II. TEACHER SALARIES

### 1966 ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers

21. Teacher salaries have a significant impact on the composition of the profession and the quality of teaching. Teachers' earning prospects affect the decision by individuals to enter or to remain in the teaching profession. They also affect how motivated teachers are and how hard they work (EFA, 2005). Teacher salaries are often insufficient to provide a reasonable standard of living, especially in developing countries. In addition, they have tended to decline over time (EFA, 2005). This negative trend in teacher salaries had already been

denounced by Education International in its 2003 Report to CEART, and it appears to be confirmed by the last evidence collected.

22. While the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers (Para 115) argues that this is not the case in the majority of countries (both OECD and developing countries), where teacher salaries remain lower than the ones of other 'equal' professions.

Teachers' salaries should:

- (a) reflect the importance to society of the teaching function and hence the importance of teachers as well as the responsibilities of all kinds which fall upon them from the time of their entry into the service;
- (b) compare favourably with salaries paid in other occupations requiring similar or equivalent qualifications;
- (c) provide teachers with the means to ensure a reasonable standard of living for themselves and their families as well as to invest in further education or in the pursuit of cultural activities, thus enhancing their professional qualification;
- (d) take account of the fact that certain posts require higher qualifications and experience and carry greater responsibilities.

23. According to international comparative surveys about income levels in various professions worldwide, such as the UBS study "Prices and Earnings Around the Globe in 2003", primary school teachers' remuneration, expressed in terms of purchasing power parity, compares unfavourably with most of 13 surveyed professions in the 70 largest cities in the world. For example, this survey shows that in few cities are teachers better paid than cooks, almost nowhere they can compete with engineers, bank clerks, and even bus drivers and skilled industrial workers are better paid in the majority of places studied. In fact, only three professions out of 13 surveyed worldwide appeared to be less competitive than teachers – female factory workers, building labourers and female sales assistants.

The trend of teachers being 'under-valued' compared to other regular popular professions with similar or lower qualification requirements is particularly evident in Central Eastern Europe, Latin America, some African and South East Asian countries.

However, it is by no means an exclusive phenomenon in developing, poor or transitional countries, where it can be explained with long-term structural reforms or economical crisis. Quite the opposite: according to the same survey (cited above), car mechanics with completed apprenticeship and 5 years working experience demonstrate remarkably higher income levels than primary teachers in cities like Copenhagen, Oslo and Toronto, while personal assistants (secretaries) with 5 years work experience, one foreign language and PC skills, are better paid than teachers in Brussels, Miami and Paris.

24. Despite the fact that this report lacks longitudinal data on salary comparisons between teachers and other professions, we argue that **the relative social value of the teaching profession, as expressed by the public remuneration level compared with other professions, is in long-term decline.** Currently available data from various independent sources increasingly point towards this conclusion.
25. Member organisations worldwide report a general tendency for teacher salaries to be lower than those related to other public professions, and identify **significant disparities in the levels of remuneration** within their countries, notwithstanding Para 117 of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers:

The salary structure should be planned so as not to give rise to injustices or anomalies tending to lead to friction between different groups of teachers.

*In general, public school teachers' salaries remain very low compared to those paid to their counterparts in some elite private schools, in both industrialised and developing countries.*

26. Salaries in urban areas are often higher than those for teachers in rural areas, especially in the developing world. This leads to remarkable differences in salaries among provinces, often as a consequence of decentralization processes (as in Argentina). Moreover, frequently little incentive, in both monetary and professional terms, is paid to teachers serving in rural areas, with the result of a constant flow of teachers towards schools in urban zones. This is clearly in contrast with the Recommendation's **Special provisions for teachers in rural or remote areas (Paras 111 to 113)**, arguing for monetary and practical support for teachers working in remote areas and for their families.
27. **Another significant disparity exists between private school teachers and public school teachers.** In general, public school teachers' salaries remain very low compared to those paid to their counterparts in some elite private schools, in both industrialised and developing countries. In Mongolia, for example, a private teacher earns on average 18 to 20% more than a public teacher. Frequently, in order to complement their earnings, many public teachers have engaged in part-time teaching, and this inevitably leads to low quality educational provision.
28. Additionally, there is, as mentioned above, **a tendency for further deterioration of teachers salaries worldwide.** In the developing world, data show that primary school teachers' salaries have on average declined in the last 25 years in the developing world. In Africa, in 1975, the average primary school teachers' salary was more than 6 times as high as per capita GDP, but in 2000 this ratio had been nearly halved. The same trend is observable in Asia, Latin America and the Middle East. Lower-income countries in general saw reductions in real earnings in the last 25 years. In the majority of European countries as well, minimum basic teacher salaries in primary and general lower secondary school are lower than per capita GDP, showing no tendency to improvement in the last years (Eurydice, 2005). This deterioration is frequently caused by an inadequate adjustment of the real value of teachers' salaries against the increase in the cost of living. Para 123(1) of the Recommendation states that **salary scales for teachers should be reviewed periodically to take into account such factors as a rise in the cost of living, increased productivity leading to higher standards of living in the country or a general upward movement in wage or salary levels.** However, this is commonly not the case.
29. **In those countries that experience very high rates of inflation, teachers' salaries do not keep the pace with them.** In Zimbabwe, for instance, teachers were graded as 'professionals' in 2002, and their remuneration was, therefore, raised correspondingly; however, no further increase has been granted in spite of the stunning rate of inflation of the country (quoted at 1193.5 as at 31 May 2006), and the salary level of new teachers remains the same, while other professional salaries have been incremented up to 175% (in May 2006). In Brazil, teachers' remunerations experienced a severe deterioration between 1995 and 2003, while their nominal increase has not been able to keep up with the real inflation rate in the country. This is true for Latin and Central America as a whole, where teachers appear to face a gradual impoverishment.
30. **The deterioration of teachers' salaries is often due to processes of decentralization.** Latin America represents a major example. In Argentina, evidence speaks of a remarkable salary loss by virtue of the decentralization process. In Chile, the progressive disarticulation of the trade union movement, together with the process of privatisation of education, has made it impossible for teachers to regain a decent remuneration level. In Nicaragua, teachers' salaries have undergone a tangible deterioration as well. In Ecuador, Bolivia, Paraguay, the current percentage of teachers in poverty is deplorable.
31. The EI office for Latin and Central America denounces, moreover, a consistent **gender disparity in earnings:** according to a study conducted in 2003<sup>3</sup>, women teachers earn less than men teachers in 6 out of 12 countries examined (notably Chile, Colombia, El Salvador, Honduras, Panama, Paraguay). Available data shows that, even in the most advanced countries, the gap between men's and women's earnings is proving difficult to eradicate, and women crowd the lower ranks of different trades and professions, but are absent at the top. This is also true in the teaching profession - a clear example being Albania. Here, many women working in the private sector do so without contracts or social protection. In the public sector, there is a

3. For more information, please contact the EI Regional Office for Latin America.

formal commitment to equal pay, but there exists a sort of hidden discrimination, as men are at the highest levels of decision-making (ETF, 2006). In the EU, broadly speaking, in spite of the community legislation on the equality of salary, women still earn 15 % less than men and this gap diminishes at a much slower rate than the work disparities between men and women.

32. **In Central and Eastern Europe and in former communist countries in general, the transition from socialist to open market economy has apparently led in certain cases to a decline in the relative value of teachers' remuneration.** In Mongolia, even if teachers' salaries keep increasing each year (by 30% in 2006), their real value still does not reach an adequate living standard for teachers. In Estonia, by legislation the minimal salary rate of teachers should be at least as high as the national average salary rate – 20% rise in salary as compared to 2006 for January 2007 – but this is not currently the case. In Ukraine, even if the national Law on Education sets a precise scale for teachers' salaries, in reality these are on average half of what is prescribed by law. This trend of salary deterioration in relative terms is observable in most of the new EU Member States, where teacher salaries relative to GDP per capita remain considerably lower than those in the old EU countries, and are not keeping the pace with the increasing cost of living (Eurydice, 2005).
33. **In Western Europe evidence is diverse.** In the UK, some real improvements in teacher pay over recent years (through above inflation pay raises and structural changes, and the improvements being made to job quality through workload reform) have enhanced the competitiveness of the teaching profession with other graduate professions. However, these improvements could be seen in light of a longer-term decline in the value of teachers' pay compared to other groups: teacher salaries still compare unfavourably with those of other graduates, in terms both of starting salary and salary progression. This failure to ensure that teachers' pay is really competitive with those of other graduate professions causes recruitment and retention problems.
34. In other words, the remuneration for the teaching profession is generally lower than the one granted to other 'equal' professions, and, in many cases, particularly in the developing world, does not allow teachers to obtain an adequate and decent living standard, especially in the presence of rising cost of living/inflation. Hence the recourse to additional jobs, or the massive drop-outs rate in many countries, or the scarce quality in the provision of public education. Furthermore, reports from member organisations worldwide confirm that this situation keeps deteriorating.
35. The issue of teacher salaries is particularly crucial if we consider **Para 115(a)** of the Recommendation (quoted above) stating that **teachers' salaries should reflect the importance to society of the teaching function, as well as teachers' responsibilities.** Teacher salaries are largely not comparable with the ones paid in other equivalent professions and, particularly, do not reflect the remuneration requirements or the upgrading granted to those professions classified as essential service providers. Moreover, teachers' remuneration schemes are usually part of the broader remuneration policy for public servants; therefore, **the uniqueness and peculiarity of the teaching profession are not given their due respect, and teachers are not granted any specific incentive or recognition.** Korea is a notable case: although the provisions for teachers' remuneration are stated in the Act 46 of the Civil Servants Act in a way to take into account not only the cost of living and the remuneration level of comparable private professions, but also the difficulty and responsibility of the job, in reality the overall teachers' remuneration falls far below that of high military officials or of employees of leading private companies.
36. Consistently with the Recommendations, salary scales should be revised, and **teachers should be paid on the basis of salary scales established in agreement with the teachers' organisations (Para 116).** However, only in certain countries is the government actually involved with teachers' organisations to undertake a **consistent revision of teachers' remunerations** – although not always in a favourable way for teachers. In Japan, for instance, the National Personnel Authority is fundamentally changing the payment system of public service workers for the first time in about 50 years, switching from the seniority-based salary to the performance-based one, which is similar to that of private companies. Trade unions are not consulted in

*This failure to ensure that teachers' pay is really competitive with those of other graduate professions causes recruitment and retention problems.*

this process. But the government has great bargaining power over the very numerous qualified teachers in the country, and it can actually manage, thanks to this over supply, to keep the quality of education high even against lower salaries. As a consequence, for example, even in presence of a law stipulating that public school teachers should receive a better wage than other public service workers to keep up the quality of public education, some prefectures are gradually reducing teachers' annual incomes.

*If teaching appears to become globally one of the least financially attractive and competitive professions in the job market of the 21st Century, ... our world is in serious long-term crisis.*

37. If teaching appears to become globally one of the least financially attractive and competitive professions in the job market of the 21st Century, not only among highly qualified ones, but also compared to non-skilled and physical occupations, our world is in serious long-term crisis. This should raise great concerns among governments and stakeholders, not only because it is a clear breach of letter and spirit of this Recommendation, but also as a primary threat to the major current policy goal - development of knowledge societies.
38. EI believes that there is a strong case for increasing teacher salaries in order to make the teaching profession more attractive. **It is crucial that governments proceed to a consistent revision of teachers' remuneration, in order to make them competitive with the remuneration granted to other equivalent professions. Moreover, this revision should definitely take into account the great responsibility placed upon the teaching profession, as well as its peculiarities.** Therefore, only a continuous and serious process of consultation with teacher organisations could ensure a real upgrading in teacher salaries likely to render the teaching profession authentically more attractive.

## 1997 UNESCO Recommendation on the Status of Higher Education Personnel

39. In higher education, it is necessary that the academic profession maintain adequate income levels, as failure to do so not only negatively affects academic performance, but it also means that the whole higher education system inevitably suffers. A clear example of this arises in Africa, where dissatisfaction with salaries is a key factor undermining the commitment of academics to their institutions and careers and, consequently, their decision or intent to leave.
40. With rising student enrolment rates, education authorities now face the reality that it is necessary to find some sort of compromise between smaller ratios of students to teaching staff against higher salaries for teachers, greater investment in teaching technology or more widespread use of assistant teachers and other paraprofessionals whose salaries are often considerably lower than those of qualified academics.
41. In most countries, **academic salary levels have not kept up with inflation, and the academic profession has lost ground compared to other professional occupations.** This latter problem was cited in EI's 2003 Report to CEART, and is of continuing concern.
42. In many countries, especially in the developing world and the middle-income nations of the former Soviet Union, **academic salaries are absolutely inadequate to live on.** In such circumstances, academic performance could deteriorate, the normal life of universities becomes difficult, and, in some extreme cases, corruption also arises. It is difficult to pinpoint the causes of academic corruption, where this arises. In some societies, ingrained corruption practices at all levels influence higher education institutions and may just be part of a bigger problem. Yet, in a number of developing and middle-income countries, corruption is specifically related to low academic salaries. This is related to the issue of integrity of university members (such as teachers, researchers, students and staff), which is not a question of individual ethics only, as the system can induce malpractice at collective level. It is clear that, in the coming years, teacher unions and Education International have to deal with 'values' and 'ethics' in general, vocational and higher education.

43. In most Anglo-American countries<sup>4</sup>, **women academics remain seriously under-represented and underpaid compared to their male colleagues.** Women are less likely to be offered tenure status than men, and the gender gap is most pronounced within the most senior academic ranks.
44. In Africa, a visible trend is that **authorities often used salary loss or cuts in salary as a threat in strikes;** and there are times when salaries are lost because reinstatement of previously dismissed or suspended academic staff is late. However, this does not only happen in Africa. A recent case in Glasgow saw striking lecturers having a percent of their pay withheld because they refused to mark students' exams.

4. The term "Anglo-American countries" as used here and in further instances below refers to the following group of countries: Australia, Canada, New Zealand, the United Kingdom, and the United States.

### III. CONSULTATIONS WITH TEACHER ORGANISATIONS

#### 1966 ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers

45. As with teacher salaries, EI believes that no educational reform can be effective without the agreement and the active involvement of the personnel ultimately responsible for its implementation, as **Para 9** of the 1966 Recommendation points out:

Teachers' organizations should be recognized as a force which can contribute greatly to educational advance and which therefore should be associated with the determination of educational policy.

*EI believes that no educational reform can be effective without the agreement and the active involvement of the personnel ultimately responsible for its implementation*

46. The latest EI Report to CEART (2003) denounced a clear and widespread violation of this article: teachers' organisations were generally not involved in any consultation regarding educational reforms in their countries, nor in the development of national EFA strategies (Africa, Asia and Latin America).
47. In the last assessment conducted by Education International (July 2006), affiliates confirmed these findings: broadly speaking, teacher organisations keep being excluded from consultations and negotiations concerning educational reforms.
48. In many countries, **teacher organisations are formally involved in the process of consultation, but do not have any real impact when it comes to taking the final decisions.** This is true for the **developing world** to a large extent. In Zimbabwe, for instance, since 1999 the teacher union is actually consulted concerning hours and other conditions of work; however, the final decision rests with the Ministry of Education. A similar situation exists in Nigeria, where unions are now strongly campaigning for the establishment of an Education Labour Relations Council for enhancing the existing labour relations in the educational process. In Mongolia, the government failed to consult with the union on education policy, curriculum, standards, educational reforms and testing, in spite of the latter's involvement in negotiations with the Ministry of Education. In Korea, unions bargain regularly with the Ministry of Education and Human Resources at the central level, while local teachers' associations bargain with each local government; nonetheless, even if the right of association and collective bargaining is recognised, executives of some teachers' unions have already been punished by the government for exercising it.
49. The situation is different in **Europe, where teacher unions generally have some real impact in the negotiations related to educational reforms.** In Denmark, unions have a substantial influence on political initiatives and decisions at the informal level, and a great impact on the definition of the conditions of work,

at both central and local levels. In Estonia, the teacher union has contracted a cooperation agreement with the Ministry of Education and Science and they collaborate intensively with the various boards of the Parliament and local authorities. In the UK, teachers' national negotiating rights, in respect of pay, working time and professional duties, were largely restricted in 1987. In 2003, social partnership between the government, employers of school teachers and trade unions representing teachers and school support staff, has tried to enhance trade unions' involvement in the decision-making concerning a wide range of education policy matters, at central as well as at local level.

5. Organismos Territoriales de Base – Grass-roots level Bodies.

50. Slight **positive developments** are reported in some developing countries. In Central and Latin America, for example, there is a tendency towards an improvement in participation by the educational community in the management and administration of educational resources, which may have a positive impact on the degree of union influence on the decision-making process (see the PROHECO project in Honduras, or the OTB<sup>5</sup> in Bolivia). However, this has not involved, so far, any real participation of teachers' organisations in decision-making. In Fiji, the government gives recognition to the two teachers' unions under the Fiji Teachers' Confederation; as a consequence, these unions are consulted concerning any change to be made to teachers' terms and conditions of work.
51. New Zealand represents a particularly successful case of teachers' involvement in consultations. After a few years of rough conflict, a tripartite agreement among the Ministry of Education, the New Zealand School Trustees Association and the teachers' union was signed, establishing a framework to allow the parties to work together on professional and career issues relevant to secondary teachers. The parties have operated successfully under this framework for a few years now.
52. The fact that **member organisations have not been consulted in relation to EFA** is striking (confirming what EI reported in 2003). Only in the Philippines, apparently, after a 'painstaking struggle', the union now sits in the body responsible for the planning, implementation and monitoring/evaluation of the EFA process, as well as in the technical working groups of the National Committee on EFA. Broadly speaking, despite the commitments made in Dakar regarding consultation with civil society, information sharing was more prevalent than longer-term consultation with the unions. Moreover, usually information sharing was concentrated in the phase of initial planning and plan validation, but not in the diagnostic process (EFA, 2005).
53. All the above mentioned cases represent a widespread reality, and are violations of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers (**Para 9**, above, as well **Paras 89 to 93 Hours and other conditions of work should be established in consultation with teachers' organisations**). Furthermore, they clearly infringe the recommendations of the Dakar Framework of Action for the implementation of the EFA goals – particularly, art.8 (iii) calling for ensuring the engagement and participation of civil society in the formulation, implementation and monitoring of strategies for educational development; art.16(i) prescribing National EFA Plans to be developed by government leadership in direct and systematic consultation with national civil society.
54. No education reform will ever achieve positive results if it does not take into consideration the real concerns of teachers: consulting with teachers' organisations is therefore a critical step governments have to make if they really want to improve education in their countries.

## 1997 UNESCO Recommendation on the Status of Higher Education Personnel

55. EI has experienced a particularly positive environment of inclusion in higher education and research matters in a number of fora, namely EU conferences and consultations, the Bologna Process (following the acceptance

of EI as a consultative member of the Bologna Follow-Up Group), OECD and UNESCO. However, it is most unfortunate that this positive attitude of inclusion cannot be said to be the same on a **national level**, where **collective bargaining and trade union rights remain precarious in several countries**.

56. Though examples of this sort are endless and cover all regions, recent episodes in Australia best illustrate the dire situation facing representative bodies in higher education. Collective bargaining has increasingly become subject to direct interference by the Australian government, even though higher education staff are not government employees, government is not a formal party to employment negotiations, and does not provide funding for raises in salary. The government recently enacted controversial reforms to university workplace relations that clearly violate ILO conventions and internationally accepted labour rights. These new requirements directly cancel the representative role played by higher education teachers' unions in collective bargaining, and restricts them from entering into campuses. Such new measures also limit the right to take industrial action, and the right to work under a collective agreement, even when staff vote for this. This Australian example is extremely relevant as it points to an unprecedented assault on trade union rights painfully accumulated in labour struggles over more than 100 years. It is important to keep in mind that in recent years, Australia has been a testing ground for neo-liberal trends which have spread to other countries. If the clock can be turned back this way in Australia, it can happen anywhere.
57. **It is essential for academic staff to be able to bargain their own conditions of employment based on existing provisions.** Higher education teaching personnel have rights through their roles and responsibilities as academics in teaching, research and public commentary. Their ability to do so is also dependent on higher education teacher organisations being free to support members through exercising representative rights.
58. It is of utmost importance to note that, as the Joint ILO/UNESCO Committee of Experts stated in 2003, social dialogue is the "glue" of successful education reform. The ILO stresses that without its widespread use in higher education, to give professors and researchers a voice in fixing salaries and employment, concepts such as collegiality and quality education will be severely tested, if not ignored altogether.

*... social dialogue is the "glue" of successful education reform*

## IV. ACADEMIC FREEDOM AND TENURE FOR TEACHERS

### 1966 ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers

59. In order to have a teaching system that is independent from any political, economical, ideological and religious influence, professional and academic freedom must be granted to all teachers. This does not mean that teachers should not be given any guidance; however, they should never be dictated which methods to use to transform curriculum objectives into practical classroom teaching. This is particularly relevant in the light of the latest decentralization trends in many countries, whereby decisions regarding curriculum and syllabus are often referred to different kinds of local authorities and school boards, leaving very few opportunities for teachers to intervene in these choices (see EI Report to CEART 2003).
60. For all these reasons, EI believes that it is of crucial importance to protect the professional freedom of all teachers, in accordance with **Para 61** of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers:
61. According to reports from member organisations, **professional freedom** seems to be in general formally granted to primary and secondary teachers. Yet this freedom is often put **under pressure from different directions**.

The teaching profession should enjoy academic freedom in the discharge of professional duties. Since teachers are particularly qualified to judge the teaching aids and methods most suitable for their pupils, they should be given the essential role in the choice and the adaptation of teaching material, the selection of text books and the application of teaching methods, within the framework of approved programmes, and with the assistance of the educational authorities.

*Teachers' professional freedom is increasingly endangered in Europe as well.*

- 62. Broadly speaking, **the Ministries of Education tend to widely interfere into teaching methods.** In Fiji, for example, unions are consulted during the process of curriculum development; nevertheless, they do not enjoy any freedom in terms of curriculum delivery, whose methods are set by the Curriculum Development Unit of the Ministry of Education. In Korea, although the right to academic freedom is granted to teachers by law, in reality elementary and middle school teachers are subjected to different kinds of restriction in the performance of their duties.
- 63. **A major instrument of pressure is the system of government inspections into school.** Algeria represents an extreme case: teachers are constantly subjected to the pressure from governmental inspectors dictating them how to do their job. This is due to the fact that school is seen by the government as an instrument of modelling of the citizens, and, therefore, curricula as well as teaching methods have to undergo precise criteria. In Mongolia as well, teachers are involved, for instance, in the development and choice of textbooks; however, they do not enjoy freedom in practice, because they are subjected to inspection and paper work evaluation by the government.
- 64. But teachers' professional freedom is increasingly endangered **in Europe** as well. Apparently, part of the Danish government has the opinion that it should be possible to identify the best practice in relation to some aspects of teaching. In the UK, the introduction, in 1988, of a National Curriculum that was highly prescriptive and bureaucratic, together with the establishment of the Office for Standards in Education (OFSTED) promoting a 'name and shame' approach, had substantially limited the professional autonomy at both local authority and school level. The government's New Relationship with Schools initiative, launched in 2004, represents an attempt in the direction of ensuring that future reform of the curriculum and models of pedagogy will sustain a movement away from excessive prescription of content and methodology, and will allow teachers to use their professional judgement to deliver a broader range of more engaging learning experiences for children and young people. However, the national curriculum and its assessment arrangements still exert pressures on teachers.
- 65. Another way of endangering the professional freedom of teachers is by **jeopardizing their stability of employment.**

Para 45: "stability of employment and security of tenure in the profession are essential in the interests of education as well as in that of a teacher and should be safeguarded even when changes in the organisation of or within a school system are made"

Para 46: "Teachers should be adequately protected against arbitrary action affecting their professional standing or career"

- 66. These paragraphs are becoming increasingly relevant in the light of the current trends of introducing performance-based pay, individual short-term contracts, and decentralisation of employment (see above as well).
- 67. Our affiliates worldwide denounce, in fact, a widespread use of **fixed-term contracts**, to be constantly renewed, or of '**probatory periods**'. The examples range from extreme cases, where teachers are hired on a tremendously short-term base (in Bahamas, apparently only expatriate teachers are given two/three-year

contracts, while the others are hired on a monthly base, or in Algeria, where contracts are to be renewed every three months, without any right to holidays, nor trade union rights, nor other labour rights or guarantees), to less brutal cases (Mauritius), where teachers are permanently employed by the Ministry after six-months/one-year probatory periods.

68. **The phenomenon of pay related to performance now plays a much bigger part in the remuneration of teachers and in career progression in the industrialised world than it was traditionally the case** (ETUCE, 2005). This has been reported from the UK, even if there is no evidence, so far, to suggest that pay related to performance in its current guise is being used to compromise academic freedom. In Japan, as well, teachers' remuneration schemes are currently being revised and assimilated to performance-related systems similar to the ones in use within the business sector. This practice clearly infringes **Para 124** of the Recommendation, which states that **No merit rating system for purposes of salary determination should be introduced or applied without prior consultation with and acceptance by the teachers' organizations concerned.**
69. Even where the tenure of employment is granted by law, **it is not always the case that teachers are protected against arbitrary action affecting their professional standing.** Teachers are widely affected by repercussions as a consequence of their political or personal beliefs and attitudes, and these repercussions come from governments as well as from parents or communities. In some African countries, there have been cases of teachers beaten up by parents/political supporters because of political reasons. Such episodes do, clearly, affect teachers' personal and professional freedom. In Korea, even if the job security of teachers is 'close to perfection' from a legal point of view, breaches of the rights of teachers and their authority often occur. In particular, 'when a teacher causes social criticism by neglecting duties, violating regulations, and losing dignity or behaving inappropriately or does harm to the school', he/she will face disciplinary actions, including dismissal, discharge, pay reduction, suspension, etc. This definition is so vague that it opens up a variety of different interpretation of 'inappropriate behaviours' likely to meet disciplinary sanctions.
70. Regarding **part-time teachers**, the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers states that:

All the provisions to which full-time teachers are entitled to should also apply to part-time teachers (Paras 59 – 60).

71. While for developing countries evidence is less available, data concerning Europe show that part-time work has been expanding in a majority of countries at primary and secondary school (Eurydice, 2005). However, there is not enough evidence regarding this particular category. In the UK, the introduction of the work-life balance provisions within the School Teachers' Pay and Conditions Document 2005 and the Part-Time Workers (Prevention of Less Favourable Treatment) Regulations 2000 provides an element of statutory protection for part-time workers. The absence of clear working time arrangements for part-time teachers, however, results in wide variations in employment practices across England and Wales and a large number of unnecessary disputes about working hours. In Slovakia, evidence suggests that all the dispositions applicable to full-time teachers are applied to part-time teachers as well.

*Teachers are widely affected by repercussions as a consequence of their political or personal beliefs and attitudes, and these repercussions come from governments as well as from parents or communities.*

## 1997 UNESCO Recommendation on the Status of Higher Education Personnel

72. As far as higher education is concerned, at the outset, it is important to recall what is stated in the preamble of the UNESCO Recommendation Concerning the Status Higher Education Teaching Personnel:

[...] the right to education, teaching and research can only be fully enjoyed in an atmosphere of academic freedom and autonomy for institutions of higher education and that the open communication of findings, hypotheses and opinions lies at the very heart of higher education and provides the strongest guarantee of the accuracy and objectivity of scholarship and research.

73. **Para 27** of the 1997 UNESCO Recommendation Concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel guarantees academic freedom as a right:

[...] Higher-education teaching personnel are entitled to the maintaining of academic freedom, [...]

74. When the 1992 Sinaia Statement on Academic Freedom and University Autonomy was adopted under the auspices of UNESCO, it stated that “history has shown that violations of academic freedom and institutional autonomy have high costs in intellectual regression, social alienation and economic stagnation”. Unfortunately, there is much to be said for history repeating itself. What is equally intriguing and upsetting is that although one would think that only progress could have been made over the years, there has been a **visible deterioration** of this principle worldwide.
75. In Northern Europe, there is great concern over visible signs of increased bureaucracy and control, political control of the use of research resources and the reduction of researchers’ free right of publication. In June 2006, the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe adopted a Recommendation<sup>6</sup> on academic freedom and university autonomy, in which it refers to these as “a fundamental requirement of any democratic society”.
76. In most Anglo-American countries, academic freedom is generally recognised and respected as an important right of academic staff. However, in these countries, a decline in public funding has paradoxically been accompanied by greater government oversight and management. In these places, there are emerging issues that constitute specific threats to academic freedom, ranging from an increase in accountability and performance assessments to a number of disturbing incidents related to the “war on terrorism”, particularly in the US.
77. In Latin America, government-related restrictions applied over the years have led to the wearing down of academic freedom, while external pressure on academic staff has also had the same negative effect in Africa, Asia and the Pacific, and the Middle East.
78. All this has been coupled with recent cases of violence or other forms of abuse against academic staff in many places. In some countries, academic staff believe that to speak out on issues that may be interpreted as critical of the government or of institutional policy will threaten their job or opportunities for advancement.
79. **Put simply, we are thus at a crisis point, at a time in which academic freedom of higher education teaching personnel is being blatantly undermined.**
80. The EI Barometer of Human and Trade Union Rights in the Education Sector (2004) contains a specific section on academic freedom, which confirms the existence of self-censorship. In some countries, faculty members believe that to speak out on issues that may be interpreted as critical of the government or of institutional policy will threaten their job or opportunities for advancement.
81. In many industrialised countries, external pressure arises from the ever-growing drive towards globalisation, competitiveness, commodification, and the increasing use of market-mechanisms in higher education. **Research funding** at higher education institutions is an issue of general concern, along the lines of the reasoning that **those “who pay the piper call the tune”**, so that funding bodies often subject the use of such funds to a number of conditions (e.g. the use and publication of research results).

6. Academic Freedom and University Autonomy’ - Recommendation 1762 [2006]

82. In other countries, the main concern is of a more serious nature, linked to under-development, and internal political or conflict constraints. Experience shows that once these latter countries overcome such problems, academic freedom is not necessarily guaranteed. Problems related to globalisation and commodification, which are already on the rise, will undeniably grow.
83. Academic freedom is a key issue in democracy. In some countries, it needs to be codified and written into the law, though this alone may not be enough. There are many places where, although this legal guarantee exists, academic freedom is still undermined in practice. In the Netherlands, where, even though new legislation set for 2007 is not envisaged to change the way academic freedom is protected by law, much discussion is currently ongoing about a more market-orientated system of higher education, which could put extra pressure on the values of academic freedom. In France, the right to academic freedom has been recognised by three decisions of the “Conseil Constitutionnel”, yet this right is being undermined through a challenge to status, an increase in precarious employment and a shift towards increasingly strict supervision at all levels. Recent events have seen a decline in academic freedom, especially in the area of scientific research, in particular due to issues linked to research funding.
84. Thus, combined with the legal guarantee, it is necessary that academic freedom is exercised in practice, so that citizens can be confident in the skill and impartiality of researchers and academic workers, and of their independence from any kind of political constraint, financial or other pressures.
85. The exercise of academic freedom is closely linked to the principle of institutional autonomy, as it is clear in the Recommendation, and the very status of teachers. Thus, the **weakening of tenure rights** has a devastating effect on academic freedom. In this respect, it is important to recall **Para 46** of the UNESCO Recommendation Concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel concerning **tenure**:

*Academic freedom is a key issue in democracy.*

“Security of employment in the profession, including tenure or its functional equivalent, where applicable, should be safeguarded as it is essential to the interests of higher education as well as those of higher education teaching personnel [ . . . ]”

86. Tenure and academic freedom are inseparable because if higher education teaching personnel fear that they will lose their jobs, by definition, this means that they cannot be free. Though an exceptional case, Finland is exemplary when it comes to tenure, as the retention of tenure for higher education teaching personnel protects them from arbitrary dismissal. Unfortunately, such good examples are a rarity.
87. In many countries, tenure systems for higher education teaching personnel are progressively being eliminated or limited, and traditional definitions of “tenure” are being challenged. A **highly visible trend** has been the **increase in precarious contracts, part-time employment and non-tenure track faculty**. Furthermore, ever fewer tenured academics are able to practice their right to academic freedom without fear of dismissal. The casualisation of the academic workforce has been one of the most significant trends over the past decade. Left unchecked, the increasing use of fixed-term and part-time appointments is steadily moving towards undermining the tenure system and fundamentally weakening academic freedom.
88. **EI is deeply concerned about the proliferation of short-term contracts.** The use of these latter has increased substantially across regions. New Zealand and the UK have recently begun to address the problem of the overuse of fixed-term contracts. Employment legislation in New Zealand now encourages the movement of staff on fixed terms into permanent positions by requiring employers to provide a genuine reason for hiring an individual on a fixed term contract. In the UK, under the provision of a European Union directive to improve the status of fixed-term employees, regulations were enacted in 2002. This attempts to ensure that fixed-term employees are treated equally with permanent employees, and allow for an employee on a fixed-

term contract that is renewed or extended to become permanent after four years. However, movement to a permanent contract is not automatic. EI welcomes this as a step in the right direction, but stresses that this good practice is not widespread. Rather, there is a steady decline of tenure everywhere.

## V. COLLEGIATE GOVERNANCE

89. When it comes to collegiate governance, it is important to recall what is provided in **Para 31** of the **UNESCO Recommendation Concerning the Status Higher Education Teaching Personnel**:

“Higher education teaching personnel should have the right and opportunity, without discrimination of any kind, according to their abilities, to take part in the governing bodies and to criticize the functioning of higher education institutions, including their own, while respecting the right of other sections of the academic community to participate, and they should also have the right to elect a majority of representatives to academic bodies within the higher education institution”.

90. Contrary to what is provided in **Para 31**, there are clear examples of a **deterioration of collegiality**. A case in point is Sri Lanka, as courses offered in universities, which were previously more academically oriented, now suffer from a greater tendency to offer curricula that are more geared to the present requirements in the country. However, a worse, and unfortunately more frequent, occurrence is that of **complete disrespect of the right of participation of higher education teaching personnel in governing bodies**. This is so that general and academic staff are often invisible within university decision-making systems, and in performance measurements which inform those decisions. Several examples are indicated below. This has largely been a consequence of the increasing trends of commercialisation and the application of market mechanisms in higher education institutions.
91. Disrespect for, and undermining of, the principle of collegiality is not as widespread as the violation of academic freedom in higher education. These two principles are not facing the same level of decline. However, clear steps backwards in terms of collegiality are visible in many countries. These two notions are also inter-linked, as academic freedom is impugned if academic staff is not able to actively participate in governance through internal debate.
92. Participation in governance is critical to the ability of universities to work in the public interest and defend the principles of academic freedom. In addition, the importance of organisational collegiality through cooperative dialogue and negotiation is a positive process for management, as well as for higher-education teaching personnel, contributing to the maintenance of institutional autonomy and accountability.
93. EI opposes the general belief that universities can no longer be run by a collegial system of governance and regrets the direct appointment of rectors, deans and heads of department. In the replies received to EI’s survey, an interesting analogy was made between direct appointments and experience of arbitrary decision-making in other areas, the latter having shown that the shortfalls of royal appointees also fall on the shoulders of the persons involved in implementation.
94. In Anglo-American countries, the increasing number of accountability and performance assessments subject staff to more intrusive bureaucratic control and oversight, which proves to be weakening to collegiate governance structures.
95. Asia has experienced a radical deterioration in terms of respect of the principle of collegiality, largely as a **consequence of privatisation or merging of higher education institutions**, and the application of

*Participation in governance is critical to the ability of universities to work in the public interest and defend the principles of academic freedom.*

corporate measures therein. This is largely visible throughout the region, yet it is mostly accentuated in Japan, where all the national universities were restructured into “university corporations” in 2004.

96. Similar problems arise in Europe, where the practice of government appointments has greatly increased recently. It is important to note that this trend in the decline of collegiate governance is diametrically opposed to current pan-European efforts in the field of higher education. As part of the ongoing **Bologna Process**, the 2005 Bergen Communiqué states:

“We underline the central role of higher education institutions, their staff and students as partners in the Bologna Process”. Furthermore, the European Union’s structures are inclusive of all the stakeholders concerned.”

97. In this context, there is additional reason to be concerned about the visible reluctance to implement the UNESCO Recommendation Concerning the Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel.
98. Furthermore, the attitude of some industrialised countries, such as Denmark, is that this recommendation is a **sort of development aid for developing countries, and that it does not apply to the conditions in industrialised countries**. This undermines the very purpose of such an instrument.

## VI. SAFE SCHOOL ENVIRONMENT AND VIOLENCE AGAINST TEACHERS

### 1966 ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers

99. According to the ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers (**Para 130**):

Teachers should be protected against the consequences of injuries suffered not only during teaching at school but also when engaged in school activities away from the school premises or grounds

100. However, different factors contribute to making schools unsafe workplaces worldwide, as pointed out by our latest investigation.
101. Sometimes schools are not safe because they are **inadequate from an infrastructural point of view**. This is very often the case in developing countries, where, especially in those areas that are experiencing a remarkable population increase due to migration or rapid economic growth, schools are frequently **still under construction**, and, in general, they lack proper safety measures; hence, both students and teachers are at risk of accidents (Korea being an example). Or, in some regions **school buildings are very old**, and the quality of their infrastructure, therefore, rather inadequate. In Mongolia, schools are more than 40/50 years-old, and their floors and ceilings are falling apart, while the heating system is often out of order; however, the lack of funding prevents repairwork.
102. Moreover, **teachers are often not insured when performing their duties, especially outside schools**. It is not so uncommon for schools in developing countries **not to have any social security schemes, nor insurance protecting teachers against the consequences of injuries suffered during teaching or when engaged in school activities within or away from the school premises or grounds**. Reports from

affiliates denounce this problem in Malawi, where most of the schools do not have any kinds of social security schemes; in Fiji, where teachers are not covered by any insurance when they are on excursions with their pupils; in Zimbabwe, where there is no specific legislation protecting teachers as a group against violence.

*The major trend concerns the increasing violence teachers are exposed to while performing their duties. This violence comes, very often, from parents, who physically and verbally assault teachers.*

103. However, the major trend concerns **the increasing violence teachers are exposed to while performing their duties**. This violence comes, very often, from parents, who physically and verbally assault teachers.
104. **Violence in school is a far too frequent reality in poor countries, and our affiliates report numerous and serious episodes**. In Mauritius, there have been cases of teachers verbally and physically abused by parents as well as by students; not only that, teachers have also been assaulted in school by strangers with cutters, swords, sticks or stones. The Ministry has been urged to provide schools with security guards or police assistance. In Algeria, teachers are very often victims of violence within the school buildings; however, no assistance is provided. In the Caribbean as a whole, violence in schools is on the rise. In Bahamas, for example, in 2005, the government tried respond to this growing trend by launching a pilot programme for 'school policing' to enhance teachers' security. However, the government has not taken any concrete measure to compensate teachers for the injuries or damage resulting from episodes of violence in schools. In Nigeria, both teachers and learners appear to be vulnerable to unwarranted attacks that come especially from the host communities of the schools; there have been several cases of external assaults on teachers performing their duties within or outside the school premises. In Malaysia, violence against teachers by parents is an increasingly widespread phenomenon. Violence against teachers is rather common in countries or regions affected by civil war. In Nepal, in the last twelve years schools have suffered from violence, terror, torture, explosions, kidnappings from both the state and the rebels. During this period, over 175 teachers lost their lives, while hundreds have been handicapped; their families have not had any benefits from any side. In Sri Lanka, on the contrary, in spite of 20 years of conflict, violence in school is not an issue.
105. **Violence in school is a mounting occurrence in the Western world as well**. Affiliates in Denmark, Poland, and Canada point out the increase in violence against teachers in their countries' schools during the last decade. In the UK, violence in school is an escalating phenomenon, and the issue of racial harassment, particularly in the wake of the global rise of anti-Islamic sentiments and racism, is a major concern. Unions have highlighted the problems of violent and disruptive pupil behaviour and focused the attention of government and schools on the issue, promoting a zero-tolerance approach to poor behaviour by pupils. As a result, the Department for Education and Skills established a working group on school security in 1996 following a number of tragic incidents. Furthermore, Safer School Partnerships (SSPs) have arisen from a joint initiative between the DfES, the Home Office, the Youth Justice Board and the Association of Chief Police Officers. The SSP initiative aims to provide structured ways in which schools can work with the local police force to achieve the following aims: (a) to reduce the prevalence of crime and victimisation amongst young people; (b) to enhance the learning environment via a safe and secure school community; (c) to help young people achieve their full educational potential; (d) to engage young people, challenge poor behaviour and build mutual respect within the school community.
106. Needless to say, **this violence affects mainly teachers belonging to 'vulnerable groups', i.e. immigrants, minorities, indigenous groups**. Women, in particular, are very often victims of violence in schools, as evidence coming from both the developed and the developing world confirms. Violence against women in the education sector takes many forms, from the overt to the subtle. It can be physical, sexual, and/or emotional and can affect female staff and students. Addressing violence against women in schools is an important topic in its own rights. Another group of teachers requiring special attention is lesbian, gay, bisexual and trans-gendered (LGBTs) people, who very often face a wide range of discriminatory attitudes, prejudices, behaviours.
107. Governments do not seem to offer adequate protection to teachers – not even in presence of such a rapidly increasing occurrence of violent episodes within the school premises. However, **Education International**

supports the development of a culture of dialogue in schools, indispensable to create a positive learning and teaching environment. A dialogue should be open, first, within the educational community, but the strengthening of the collaboration with outside experts, such as police forces or social workers, should not be excluded as a means to prevent and resolve conflicts and crises in school (El Health and Safety Seminar in Education, Warsaw, May 2006).

## 1997 UNESCO Recommendation on the Status of Higher Education Personnel

108. In higher education, although academic staff and public service workers in general are, for the most part, protected against violence and injury at work, there are still a disturbing amount of cases making this issue a cause for concern. Even though the data available does not provide an excessively large number of such cases, it is undeniably disturbing that such occurrences take place at all. It is unacceptable that, in fulfilling this role, higher education teaching personnel become the target of violence.
109. From the cases that have been brought to our attention, it is clear that **violence is not only physical, but can also be inflicted as other forms of abuse, arising for a number of reasons.** At times rebel groups, dissidents or political unrest give rise to such actions, while at other times, these originate from governmental or state acts - where certain professors are controversial, critical, or particularly active in the fight for teachers' rights or in the representation of higher education teaching personnel. This latter source of violence and abuse is definitely the most alarming occurrence, and, notwithstanding any sorts of explanation put forward in individual cases, there is no manner in which it can be justified.

7. Pp.30 of the UNESCO Global Education Digest (UNESCO UIS/ OECD/ Eurostat, 2006) – "Ultimate control is decided with reference to who has the power to determine the general policies and activities of the institution and to appoint the officers who manage it. For comparative purposes, a further distinction is made in terms of funding sources. A government-dependent private institution either receives 50% or more of its core funding from government agencies or has a teaching staff paid by a government agency. An independent private institution receives less than 50% of its core funding from government agencies and its teaching staff is not paid by a government agency

## VII. PRIVATE SCHOOLS AND INSTITUTIONS

110. First, it is important to define what is meant by public and private education. For this purpose, it is relevant to look at the definition provided by UNESCO<sup>7</sup>, which distinguishes between a public agency and a private entity according to who exerts the "ultimate control" over an institution. Notwithstanding this, it is also important to consider whether an institution is providing education in a "non-profit" or "for-profit" manner, as this directly influences the purpose, mission, organisation and methods of governance and work.

### 1966 ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers

111. Broadly speaking, private schools enjoy great freedom in terms of conditions of employment as well as in terms of curricula. This means that, apart from very rare cases, they are not subjected to government control or to any other kind of control. Therefore, there is absolutely no guarantee that the provisions of the Recommendations are actually met in private schools and institutions.
112. Our affiliates from **developing countries** report that the number of private institutions is rapidly growing; in some countries, the private enrolment as percentage of the total enrolment in secondary school is way over 50%. In the developing world as whole, it reaches almost one fifth of the total enrolment rate (EFA, 2005). In general, **private schools do not meet the provisions of the Recommendation.** They are free on their own premises to control, manage and provide education. In other words, they are free to decide upon the recruitment, the salary and the conditions of employment of their teachers. **This leads to a very common situation of absolutely inadequate working conditions for teachers:** they are often low paid, they do

not have stability of employment, they do not have benefits or social security, they do not receive any in-service training nor are they able to enjoy trade union rights. However, it is crucial to highlight that the term 'private school' encompasses a wide range of extremely different educational institutions, going from profit, to no-profit, to very upper-class elite schools, to schools with smaller capital, and so on. That is why there are such tremendous differences among the whole range of diverse private institutions. Nonetheless, although teachers are better paid in those private schools addressing special upper-class groups and imposing very high fees, in most cases there is no evidence to conclude that private school teachers enjoy more protection and better working conditions.

113. Korea represents a particular example. In Korea, a private school is created and governed by a private school foundation but primary/secondary school governance is subjected to the guidance and supervision of provincial superintendents, and colleges and universities governance is under the supervision of the minister of Education & Human Resource Development. Private high schools in Korea account for 49.3% of the total students, and the share becomes even larger (78.5%) for universities. Since 2001, the government has run six so-called 'independent private schools' as a pilot project allowing the schools freedom in accepting students, managing curriculum, setting tuition fees. Four years after the beginning of the project, the government tried to expand the independent models but met with great resistance from teachers' unions, some parents and civic groups. The fate of independent schools will be determined after two additional years of the pilot.
114. Data from **Europe** (where independent private primary and secondary education accounts on average for 2.5% - Eurydice, 2005) suggests, as well, that the provisions of the Recommendation are not really met by private schools, which actually set their own terms and conditions for teachers. As a consequence, whilst some private schools are committed to employing teachers on salaries 'in line with' national pay scales and agreements, other private employers adopt their own scales. This is the case for independent schools in the UK. A survey conducted in 2004 among 83 independent preparatory, secondary, special needs and boarding schools in five counties in the North West of England confirmed that pay and conditions for teachers in independent schools are far worse than those secured through national pay negotiations and the National Agreement. In 2004, academy schools have been introduced: these are state funded independent schools. Most of the academy schools have imposed their own pay and conditions for teaching staff; the pay can be slightly higher but the terms and conditions created are mostly detrimental, with increased hours.

## 1997 UNESCO Recommendation on the Status of Higher Education Personnel

*In the ever-increasing number of private higher education institutions, the rights traditionally pertinent to higher education teaching personnel are completely ignored.*

115. In higher education, privatisation of a "for-profit" nature has been a direct and obvious consequence of progressive globalisation and liberalisation, and the ongoing and increasingly widespread accompanying trends of market-type mechanisms to foster excellence, innovation, and competitiveness. This is directly related to EI's concerns regarding developments in trade in education under the GATS, as expressed in EI's 2003 report to CEART.
116. In a significant number of countries, the private sector accounts for a larger portion of higher education provision than the public one. The reality is that, in the ever-increasing number of private higher education institutions, **the rights traditionally pertinent to higher education teaching personnel are completely ignored**. As a rule, academic staff in private higher education institutions are denied the right to form unions. In this respect, Poland provides the only positive example, since trade unions in private higher education now exist there. Collegiate governance is also a term that is unheard of in private higher education provision.
117. A characteristic of private "for-profit" provision of higher education is a **complete disregard of academic freedom rights**. A study carried out for EI on academic freedom in Latin America points to the situation in

Argentina, which is a particularly suitable example in this respect. EI's study shows that **administrative and political despotism are the norm in private universities**. On one hand, the (few) very best private universities tend to be local replicas of some of the most prestigious American universities, concentrating especially in the soft sciences and in the administrative-managerial area. In these cases, the primacy of the *pensée unique* is absolute: scholarly work has to be carried out in accordance with the ruling orthodoxy coming as the natural by-product of globalisation, and there is no room, nor any incentive, to develop critical approaches. On the other hand, the merely commercial institutions delivering higher education services, though referred to as "universities", grant no academic freedom whatsoever.

118. This completes the circle on the basis of which EI's apprehensions on trade in education are based. There are compelling reasons to be concerned that the GATS poses serious threats to higher education. GATS explicitly applies to private higher education as a tradable service.
119. While the WTO Secretariat and many governments maintain that public higher education services are not subject to the GATS, in accordance with the GATS rules, in order for there to be an exemption from the scope of application of the GATS, services supplied "in the exercise of governmental authority", which in turn, have to meet both criteria of being supplied on neither a commercial basis, nor in competition with other providers to be exempted from GATS. On close examination, it is unlikely that any higher education system could pass this test, as higher education is characterised by mixed systems, and allows the presence of both public and private schools. In fact, many countries in recent years have been promoting greater privatisation, commercialisation and liberalisation of education. In accordance with what has been reported above, this can only be seen as bad news for higher education teaching personnel.

*There are compelling reasons to be concerned that the GATS poses serious threats to higher education.*

## VIII. HIV/AIDS

120. **The HIV and AIDS pandemic has disastrous implications for many aspects of the education sector:** both teachers and learners are infected and affected; curricula need to be developed and implemented; the supply and demand of teachers have to be revised; stigma and discrimination to be addressed; girls' education and HIV prevention to be prioritised and huge numbers of orphans and vulnerable children to be provided for. These and many other issues demand permanent attention from education authorities, teachers' unions and civil society.
121. **EI notes growing worldwide attention to the impact of HIV and AIDS on the education sector, and the response of the educators in countering the pandemic.** At international and national level, EI and its affiliates have taken major steps to be in the forefront of the education response.
122. Over the past three years, EI affiliates worldwide have stepped up their efforts to offer in-service training to some 133,000 teachers via the HIV and AIDS Education Programme. From four countries in Southern Africa in 2001 to 12 in 2004, in 2006 over 35 unions in 25 countries are involved in the HIV and AIDS Education Programme, now known as the EFAIDS Programme. Most of the activities are implemented by teachers' unions in Sub Sahara Africa, the region most affected by the pandemic. However, initiatives have also been taken to expand to Asia and Latin America. Furthermore, many of the 19 affiliates in the Caribbean are now involved in HIV and AIDS training initiatives. Such expansion is an indication of the political priority EI and its affiliates give to addressing the pandemic adequately. Such priority was underscored by the EI Congress held in 2004.
123. Quality education is cited as the best social vaccine to fight HIV and AIDS. EI takes the view that the fight against HIV and AIDS is to be seen in the context of achieving the Education for All (EFA) goals. There is an undeniable link between these two. HIV and AIDS represent a direct threat to reaching the Education

For All goals, whilst a lack of schooling in turn contributes to the spread of the pandemic. Building this strong linkage between HIV and EFA led to the development of the comprehensive EFAIDS programme that addresses HIV&AIDS and EFA through the development of policy, training, advocacy, research and publicity.

124. **Most unions involved in the programme report that a key element within their HIV and AIDS education programme is the partnership with the education authorities, the ministries of health and civil society.** This aspect of partnership has been emphasised right from the start of the programme and turned out to be beneficial to all involved. Ministries of Education allow teachers to use the education leave to attend the training and the Ministries of Health provide the necessary medical expertise. At international level EI operates in close cooperation with the World Health Organisation (WHO) and with the Education Development Center (EDC). Likewise, the work within the Inter-Agency Task Team (IATT) on Education reinforces the joint approach and provides EI the opportunity to emphasise the role of the teaching community in giving an adequate response.
125. Worldwide of those infected in the age group 16 to 24, almost 75% are girls and young women. This is a clear indication of the need for schools to put a specific emphasis on HIV prevention through the training of girls at the youngest possible age. Girls' education in HIV prevention is the cornerstone of any effective response by the education sector.
126. An independent study carried out in 2004/2005 shows that the HIV and AIDS training programme led to an increase in knowledge and skills of the teachers. But most important is the fact that after training, teachers have greater confidence in their capacity to address the issue of HIV and AIDS in debates with colleagues and in their day to day work with pupils and students.
127. **Despite progress made, unions worldwide report that the activities of the Ministries of Education are still not meeting the needs.** A survey in 8 countries made by EI on the basis of input provided by the affiliates shows that in the majority of these countries no systematic and ongoing training through pre- and in-service training is being provided. It is all very well that the unions make efforts to reach out to large segments of their membership, but at the end of the day, it is the MoE which needs to ensure that the scaling up and integration of these training programmes within the curricula takes place. Failing to do so jeopardises the ultimate response, i.e. having a well trained cohort of teachers capable of handling many aspects of the pandemic in the school setting.
128. The impact of HIV and AIDS falls directly on the workplace and requires a direct response from union representatives at all levels. Unions are confronted with dismissals, transfers, stigma and discrimination of their members. The already weak social security system in many countries is further undermined by the pandemic. These aspects and others should be addressed through HIV and AIDS workplace policies developed by unions and the education authorities. Here too, EI promotes dialogue and partnership. It is regrettable that not all governments realise the critical role the teachers and their unions can and must play. Rather than considering unions as allies in a joint struggle, they focus on the traditional approach of exclusion of teachers in the drafting of programmes and policies.
129. EI strives to achieve a scenario in which healthy and well prepared teachers contribute positively to controlling the pandemic. To do so, they require support in the following areas:

- **Recruitment:** To date, the practice of governments in many of those countries most seriously affected by HIV and AIDS, has been to merely replace teachers lost due to natural attrition with unqualified teachers. In the current situation, this is no longer tenable. More fully qualified teachers must be taken on in response to the losses incurred due to HIV and AIDS, rather than the current practice of employing volunteer or para-teachers to cut costs. The latter may have serious repercussions for the quality of teaching and the fight against AIDS.

*Worldwide of those infected in the age group 16 to 24, almost 75% are girls and young women ... Girls' education in HIV prevention is the cornerstone of any effective response by the education sector.*

- **Pre and in-service training on HIV & AIDS:** The 1966 Recommendation Concerning the Status of Teachers stipulates the importance of providing teachers with ‘the required professional knowledge and skills’ to do their job. Against the backdrop of a pandemic which claimed 3.8 million lives last year, knowledge and skills in the area of HIV and AIDS are essential. However, as demonstrated in the EI Report ‘Training for Life’, formal preparation is largely lacking in those countries where it is most desperately needed, namely Sub-Saharan Africa. All teacher training should include mandatory components on HIV and AIDS that are examinable.
- **Curriculum:** Establish HIV and AIDS education as a formal component within the school curriculum
- **Protect teachers from HIV and AIDS related discrimination** by establishing an education sector policy on HIV and AIDS for schools and by launching large-scale public awareness campaigns
- **Facilitate collective and social dialogue:** Teachers’ unions should be consulted on policy in relation to the response to HIV and AIDS within the education sector
- **Increase access to treatment, care and support for teachers living with HIV and AIDS**

## CONCLUSIONS

130. Forty years have passed since the adoption of the 1966 ILO/UNESCO Recommendation Concerning the Status of Teachers. Almost a decade has gone by since governments in 1997 made further commitments to quality education provision by adopting the UNESCO Recommendation on the Status of Higher Education Personnel.

131. What has been achieved during this time?

132. This report by EI to CEART intends to overview the progress and shed some light on the abovementioned issues from the perspective of education personnel – represented by teachers’ unions worldwide. It follows a previous report in 2003, in which we already illustrated major trends in the implementation of both Recommendations.

133. Undoubtedly, there have been many developments: sustained reforms of education systems worldwide, involving the profound change of teaching and learning philosophy, and invention of mass public education in most countries in the world. These reforms were inspired and guided to a great extent by the abovementioned Recommendations, which focused on the critical aspects of education systems – provision and status of education employees, teachers and academic personnel worldwide.

134. This Report demonstrates that, **in all the major issues addressed, key Paragraphs of the Recommendations are not duly fulfilled, or are largely disregarded, in the current policies of many governments.**

135. **Teacher Shortage** represents undoubtedly a main issue in education. An increasing number of teachers are retiring or leaving the profession, while the supply of newly qualified teachers is not rising. Our research indicates principal reasons for this trend: deteriorating or simply inadequate living and working conditions for teachers, which make the profession unattractive for both already working personnel and potential new entrants. This problem, of course, is not new; it was identified already in 1966, yet never resolved. Available evidence shows that **the majority of governments are applying two strategies:** the intensification of the workload of teachers already in service in developed countries, and the mass-scale engagement of unqualified personnel with even less provisions into teaching, in developing countries. In Higher Education, similar trends persist, leading to severe problems of “deprofessionalisation” of academic staff and “brain drain” from developing countries to developed ones.

136. Both strategies seriously undermine the quality and, in the long-term, the public credibility of education systems. Moreover, these lines of action represent a clear departure from the Recommendations, which call

*Undoubtedly, there have been many developments: sustained reforms of education systems worldwide, involving the profound change of teaching and learning philosophy, and invention of mass public education in most countries in the world.*

for an improvement in working and living conditions as a primary tool for the provision of quality education. Compared to the previous Report to CEART in 2003, the situation on the global scale has not improved; rather, the same trends have developed further.

*Priority must be given to the recruitment, training and retention of qualified teachers. We will have to motivate young people in the South as well as in the North to enter the teaching profession.*

137. **EI strongly opposes these trends and calls for a significant turn of government policies towards a focus on improvements of living and working conditions of teaching personnel**, according to the requirements of the Recommendations. Also, we insist on the maintenance and improvement of high quality standards through extensive education programs for teachers – however, we doubt that these alone can solve the issue. As EI General Secretary Fred van Leeuwen pointed out at the EI/UNESCO joint launching of the UNESCO Institute of Statistics report “Teachers and Education Quality” (2006). Priority must be given to the recruitment, training and retention of qualified teachers. We will have to motivate young people in the South as well as in the North to enter the teaching profession. In order to achieve this objective, the profession itself should be made more attractive in terms of employment conditions and career opportunities.
138. Another major area of concern, closely connected to the issue of working and living conditions, is **salaries**. A negative trend of decline in teachers’ remuneration was already noted by EI in its 2003 Report to CEART. As we see now – 3 years later – this trend has continued in the same direction. The Recommendations clearly demand governments to maintain a level of salaries for the teaching profession to be attractive, and competitive with others. Moreover, teacher remuneration should be kept at levels which ensure reasonable standard of living, as well as the teachers’ capacity for professional development. The Report argues that this is increasingly not the case in most of the countries. **Teacher salaries in the cities of the developed world are becoming less and less competitive compared to other professions with similar or even lower qualifications. In developing and middle-income countries, they fall far short in relation to growing inflation and cost of living.**
139. We illustrate that governments are often trying to avoid the problem by resorting to decentralisation of education systems, by delegating responsibilities of salary provision to the municipalities, local administrations, private providers, and by inventing various forms of differentiation among teaching personnel. In higher education, the trend is to employ more assistant-teachers and other paraprofessionals in the context of an increasing economic autonomy of institutions, in order to save money.
140. EI finds that this trend of pay decentralisation and differentiation is mainly based on “effectiveness” concepts, which dominate the current policy debates, and are particularly disturbing in the face of the decreasing social attractiveness and diminishing authority of the teaching profession as such, observable worldwide. We insist in going back to the spirit of the Recommendations, based on a high social prestige of the profession as a long-term guarantee for social cohesion, overall progress and stability, and requiring an adequate pay level for the profession as a whole, not just the offering of opportunities to the few most competitive individuals.
141. When it comes to designing particular education strategies in countries that can deal with all these issues, **consultations with education professionals** are crucial. Only those who work in schools and education institutions have the proper insight in how to tackle the education-related problems. The Recommendations clearly call for governments to recognise teachers’ representative organisations as partners in policy making.
142. This report, as well the previous one, shows widespread violation of this provision, particularly at the national level. Teacher organisations keep being excluded from consultations and negotiations concerning education reforms. Even where they are recognized as partners in social dialogue, their impact is often limited to formal consultations without further real involvement in decision-making or implementation. Paradoxically, the situation is better at international level, where EI has been able to participate in all major forums where education is discussed, such as the EU, OECD and UNESCO, actively and inclusively representing the interests of its members. **EI, along with the ILO and UNESCO, strongly believes that social dialogue is the “glue” of successful education reforms.**

143. **Academic Freedom and Tenure for Teachers** is critical in order to preserve and provide an education system that is free from political, economical, ideological and religious influence and pressure. The Recommendations are clear on this aspect, and request that teachers and professors must be free to decide on curricular methods and materials, selection of textbooks, aids, etc. Such freedom is an essential guaranty for both quality of education and the liberty of society in general. Although the concepts of academic freedom are overall recognised in general primary and secondary as well as in higher education, there are an increasing number of cases of interference in educational matters, both from the side of public authorities and from other actors, like markets, the media and the church. **In general education, there is evidence of increasing control over curriculum, pedagogy and methodology from the side of governments**, trying to address political and social problems with “educational instruments”. **In higher education, the ever increasing pressure comes from globalisation, competitiveness, commodification and use of market mechanisms**. These trends seriously challenge the fundamental notions of academic independence, autonomy, tenure, as well as collegiality and collegiate governance.
144. Collective decision-making is of utmost importance at all levels, whether national, local or institutional. In higher education institutions, **the more and more frequent practice of exclusion of academic staff from the governing bodies** has led to disregarding the principle of **collegiate governance**. Hence, academics are no longer able to voice their opinion on matters regarding the environment in which they work - or, when they do put forward their views, these are unheeded. This is one of the areas in which a visible step backwards has been made. Previously, the level of participation in the governing bodies of higher education institutions was guaranteed. Nowadays, such guarantee and, sometimes, the very existence of the governing body as a whole are being threatened. This is a consequence of the increase in the practice of direct appointments, and of the growing power of “presidents”, “directors” or “managers” of higher education institutions. **El regrets the way in which such matters have developed and strongly opposes the opinion that collegiate governance is an outdated notion in higher education systems nowadays**.
145. El is deeply concerned with these trends, which lead to the proliferation of short-term contracts, marketability of research, commercialisation of curriculum and programs. We see great danger to our societies if educational institutions will become just like enterprises selling their products to customers, and being run by sales managers rather than by collective bodies of educators.
146. Particularly, we are concerned with the **spread of private institutions at the expense of public schools and universities**. In its 2004 Congress resolution “Education: public service or commodity”, El reiterates that education is not a commodity and should not be privatised, and affirms that education should be a common space for sharing and transmitting knowledge. Undermining the public education system through privatisation policies will profoundly change the nature of our democratic societies and increase inequalities in access to education. Public authorities bear a major responsibility in opening up access to education for all; transferring some or all of that responsibility to other actors can only be considered as a makeshift crisis solution.
147. Faced with the disturbing evidence provided in this Report, El calls for reversing this trend by complying with the Recommendations, and actually advancing all forms of involvement of the educational community. Our evidence shows that this can contribute significantly both to social accountability of teachers and to quality of management as well.
148. Living and working conditions of teachers are also seriously threatened by the **spreading phenomenon of violence in schools**. The Recommendation of 1966 argues that teachers should be protected against consequences of injuries while performing their tasks both in schools and outside. This requires, in first place, a sound and effective insurance system, which in many parts of the world remains a dream for teachers. But in developed countries as well, during the recent decades, teachers have become subject to direct classroom violence as part of a broader change of culture in societies and, particularly, in education institutions.

*Undermining the public education system through privatisation policies will profoundly change the nature of our democratic societies and increase inequalities in access to education.*

149. EI pays increasing attention to the problem. We believe that only the **further development of collective governance and responsibility of teachers, the involvement of parents and the community working towards the maintenance of a climate of co-operation and tolerance in schools** can provide a solution. Unfortunately, as this Report shows, governments do not seem to offer adequate protection to teachers, neither to consider support measures for schools to develop co-operative strategies against this growing violence.
150. A key area of concern we are addressing in this Report is the **spread of HIV/AIDS**. This has become the major cause of deaths of millions for people in many regions in the world, and a factor undermining the very existence of public school systems in several African countries. The Report shows the drastic scale of the problem and the lack of international capacity to address it, despite all efforts to date. The spread of the pandemic undermines the achievement of the EFA goals. We are particularly concerned with discriminatory practices against HIV-affected professionals. The pandemic has also its gender aspect: the majority of people affected by HIV/AIDS worldwide are women.
151. **EI calls for concerted actions of the international community**. Meanwhile, we place **great emphasis on the role educators can play through education programs**.
152. **Gender** remains a critically relevant aspect to be tackled in all the key issues raised in this Report, particularly concerning pay equity, violence against teachers and discrimination.
153. Despite many difficulties in implementing the Recommendations, remarkable progress has been achieved in the past. However, as this report illustrates, today we are facing several major system-wide problems, which may undermine the achievements made so far, and, if not addressed by appropriate and adequate policies, even lead to a regress in the provision of quality education to all.
154. This Report argues that both Recommendations are not adequately implemented. Additionally, new challenges have emerged, perhaps requiring an expansion of the scope of the Recommendations. However, the current provisions are fundamental for maintaining education as a public good, as well as in tackling these emerging issues. The Recommendations should be properly implemented throughout the world, so that every child may indeed have the opportunity to learn, grow and contribute to his or her fullest potential.

*The Recommendations should be properly implemented throughout the world, so that every child may indeed have the opportunity to learn, grow and contribute to his or her fullest potential.*



## REFERENCES

- **Education International (2004)** – *El Barometer*
- **Education International, Pan European Structure, Seminar on Health and Safety in Education, Warsaw, May 2006**
- **UNESCO Institute for Statistics (UIS), Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) and World Education Indicators (WEI) Programme (2005)** – ‘*Education Trends in Perspective’ Analysis of the World Education Indicators*
- **Paul Bennett (2005)** – *General Report of Education International’s Higher Education and Research Conference ‘Higher Education and Research Staff in the 21st Century’*
- **Brian Everett (2005)** – *Issues Paper for Education International’s Higher Education and Research Conference ‘Brain Drain/Brain Gain’*
- **Atilio Boron (2005)** – *Issues Paper for Education International’s Higher Education and Research Conference ‘Academic Freedom in Latin America’*
- **T. Fukiharu (2005) - Faculty of Economics, Hiroshima University, Japan** ‘*The Reform of Higher Education in Japan: A Game-Theoretic Analysis of Intensified Competition’*
- **David Robinson (2006)** – *Report prepared for Education International ‘The Status of Higher Education Teaching Personnel in Australia, Canada, New Zealand, the United Kingdom and the United States’*
- **International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU, 2006)** - *Annual Survey ‘of violations of trade union rights’*
- **Council of Europe Recommendation (2006)** – ‘*Academic Freedom and Institutional Autonomy’*
- *Bulletin of the American Association of University Professors (March-April 2006)* – ‘*Academe’*
- **UNESCO (2006)** – *Global Education Digest*
- **Education International (2006)** – *Results of questionnaire for CEART report*
- **EFA (2005) Education For All Global Monitoring Report 2005 – The Quality Imperative. UNESCO**
- **ETUCE (2005) REPORT of the ETUCE - TRACE Seminar Teachers’ Working Conditions. Restructuring: Trends in Teachers’ Pay, Sesimbra, 22-24 October 2005**
- **Education International Report to CEART 2003**
- **Eurydice (2005) Key data on education in Europe 2005. European Commission**
- **The European Training Foundation (2006) Study on Women in Education and Employment 2010**
- **UNESCO Institute of Statistics (2006) Report Teachers and Education Quality: Monitoring Global Needs for 2015**





## ADDITIONAL REFERENCES – WEBSITES

### **UNESCO**

<http://www.unesco.org>

### **ILO - International Labour Organisation**

<http://www.ilo.org>

### **CEART**

<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/dialogue/sector/techmeet/ceart>

### **UNESCO Institute for Statistics (UIS)**

<http://www.uis.unesco.org>

### **World Education Indicators (WEI) Programme (UIS)**

[http://www.uis.unesco.org/ev.php?URL\\_ID=3767&URL\\_DO=DO\\_TOPIC&URL\\_SECTION=201](http://www.uis.unesco.org/ev.php?URL_ID=3767&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201)

### **EFA - Education for All**

<http://www.unesco.org/education/efa>

### **Education International**

<http://www.ei-ie.org>

### **ETUCE - European Trade Union Committee for Education**

<http://www.csee-etu.org>

### **Eurydice**

<http://www.eurydice.org>

### **Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD)**

<http://www.oecd.org>



Education International  
Internationale de l'Éducation  
Internacional de la Educación

5 bd du Roi Albert II  
1210 Brussels, Belgium  
Tel +32-2 224 06 11  
Fax +32-2 224 06 06  
[headoffice@ei-ie.org](mailto:headoffice@ei-ie.org)  
[www.ei-ie.org](http://www.ei-ie.org)

Education International represents more than 29 million teachers and education workers from pre-school to university.

With 350 member organisations in more than 160 countries, it is the world's largest global union federation.

Education International defends the rights of teachers, education workers and students, and advocates for quality universal public education.

